



22nd April, 2019

TL19/2204/1A

Syed Mumtaz Shah,
Chief Secretary Sindh,
Government of Sindh,
Karachi.

Sub: Tender for Procurement of School Furniture for Public Sector Schools.

Dear Sir,

School Education & Literacy Department, Government of Sindh formed a tender committee for Procurement of School Furniture under school specific budget in September, 2018 in which representative of Transparency International Pakistan was also co- opted as member, by the Secretary Education Govt. of Sindh.

2. After various meetings tender floated for the procurement of 37120 and 14060 dual desk for various schools on 17th February, 2019.
3. The approved estimate cost of procurement is stated to be Rs. 600 Million.
4. On 19th March, 2019 technical proposals were opened and it was decided that the financial proposals shall be opened urgently after evaluation of technical proposals is completed.
5. On 28th March, 2019 financial proposals were opened.

Prior to opening of financial proposals there were two issues which intended to be resolved. One was, a bidder submitted his bid by TCS, which was received by department 4 days prior to closing date, and was not included by the department in the tender opening, and bidder complained to SPPRA. Second, was a bidder who did not submit the samples, which was asked by the department 4 days prior to financial opening, with excuse given by bidder that he did not receive the letter on time.

In order to avoid to any controversy, the committee agreed to include both bidders in tendering process and opened the financial bids.

Fortunately both bidders' financial bids were higher than the lowest bidders.

6. Following were the results of the bid opening

Lot No.	Vendor	Description	Quantity	Unit Rate Including Taxes	Total Amount
1	M/s Rizwan	Dual Desk for class 1 to 05	37120	Rs. 5,700/-	Rs.211,584,000
2	M/s M. Jamil	Dual Desk for class 6 to 10	14060	Rs. 6,860/-	Rs. 96,451,600



Two separate companies were the lowest in Lot No. 1 and Lot No. 2, and the total cost of procurement is almost half of the approved estimated cost of the procurement, which is about Rs. 308 Million, against approved estimated budget of Rs. 600 Million.

7. In the meeting the Chairman desired to cancel tender due to shortage of time. The Chairman of the committee was of the view that the time is short and contractor will not be able to supply the dual desks by 30th June, 2019 and the quantity of 51,180 is very huge for any contractor.

8. The committee asked the two successful bidders to confirm if they would be able to supply the dual desks in time. Both bidders confirmed that they will be able to supply in time, and in case of delay, the provision of Liquidity damages be imposed on them.

9. In the meeting the representative of TI- Pakistan and General (R) Moin Haider, another coopted member insisted that the contract should be awarded, as over 600 schools are in operation since last 2 years without school furniture in various parts of Sindh.

10. But on 18th April, 2019, the School Education & Literacy Department, posted a tender of cancellation notice, without informing the tender committee co-opted members.

11. The Chief Secretary, Sindh is requested to consider following and issue directions to stop such delaying tactics by department, which is causing millions of rupees losses to nation;

1. Why 50% high estimated cost in dual benches was prepared and approved by the department?
2. Why Contracts to two lowest bidder, is not awarded, though the cost saving is 50%
3. Who will pay the escalated cost in case future tender are at higher rates, as annual escalation of 6.5% is already prescribed by the Planning Commission?
4. Who is responsible for keeping 600 classes of Sindh schools in effective, due to non-availability of dual desk?.
5. When the tenders were invited in February 2018, and full process finalized in March 2019, why the Chairman of the Committee opposed the award of Contract?

Transparency International Pakistan is striving for across the board application of Rule of Law, which is the only way to stop corruption.

Justice Zia Perwez
Former Judge of Supreme Court of Pakistan and High Court of Sindh
Trustee- TI-Pakistan

Annexure: Evaluation Report and Tender Cancellation Notice attached.

Copies forwarded for the information with request to take action under their mandate to:

1. Chief Minister, Government of Sindh, Karachi.
2. Chief Justice, Sindh High Court, Karachi
3. Director General, NAB, Karachi.
4. Managing Director, SPPRA, Karachi.
5. Prof Nisar Ahmed Siddique, Vice Chancellor, Sukkur, IBA University.
6. Lt. General Moinuddin Hyder (Rtd.), Member Steering Committee, Adopt a School Program, Se& LD.
7. Mr. Khalid Hussain, Senior Manager, Information Science Technology Dept, Govt. of Sindh.
8. Mr. Musarrat Mukhtar, Deputy Director, Industries Dept, Govt. of Sindh.
9. Director (Primary/ Secondary), School Education & Literacy Department.
10. Mr. Abdul Jabbarr, Project Director, Sukkur, IBA University.
11. Assistant Director, Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory.

**PROCUREMENT OF SCHOOL FURNITURE FOR PUBLIC SECTOR SCHOOLS,
SCHOOL EDUCATION & LITERACY DEPARTMENT,
Comparative Statement of Financial Bids For Lot #02**

SNO	VENDOR'S NAME	ITEM'S DETAILS	QUANTITY	UNIT COST IN RS (including 17% GST)	TOTAL COST IN RS	BID SECURITY AMOUNT	RANK	REMARKS/COMMENTS
1	MS Oriental Furniture Works	Dual Desk for Class 06 to 10	14,060	10,764.00	151,341,840.00	4,600,000.00	7	
2	MS New Apex Woodworks	Dual Desk for Class 06 to 10	14,060	8,783.00	123,488,980.00	6,180,000.00	4	
3	MS Fine Woodworks	Dual Desk for Class 06 to 10	14,060	8,410.00	118,244,600.00	6,180,000.00	3	
4	MS Rizwan Furniture	Dual Desk for Class 06 to 10	14,060	7,000.00	98,420,000.00	4,011,160.00	2	
5	MS M. Jamil Furniture Mart	Dual Desk for Class 06 to 10	14,060	6,860.00	96,451,600.00	3,618,596.00	1	
6	MS Faiz Scientific Company	Dual Desk for Class 06 to 10	14,060	9,886.50	139,004,190.00	1,400,000.00	6	
7	MS PAKSON	Dual Desk for Class 06 to 10	14,060	9,540.00	134,132,400.00	1,341,350.00	5	

M. Nadeem

[Signature]
28/3/2019

**PROCUREMENT OF SCHOOL FURNITURE FOR PUBLIC SECTOR SCHOOLS,
SCHOOL EDUCATION & LITERACY DEPARTMENT,
Comparative Statement of Financial Bids For Lot #01**

SNO	VENDOR'S NAME	ITEM'S DETAILS	QUANTITY	UNIT COST IN RS (including 17% GST)	TOTAL COST	BID SECURITY AMOUNT	RANK	REMARKS/COMMENTS
1	MS Oriental Furniture Works	Dual Desk for Class 01 to 05	37,120	10,413.00	386,530,560.00	4,600,000.00	5	
2	MS New Apex Woodworks	Dual Desk for Class 01 to 05	37,120	8,320.00	308,838,400.00	6,180,000.00	4	
3	MS Fine Woodworks	Dual Desk for Class 01 to 05	37,120	8,263.00	306,722,560.00	6,180,000.00	3	
4	MS Rizwan Furniture	Dual Desk for Class 01 to 05	37,120	5,700.00	211,584,000.00	4,011,160.00	1	
5	MS M. Jamil Furniture Mart	Dual Desk for Class 01 to 05	37,120	7,150.00	265,408,000.00	3,618,596.00	2	
6	MS Faiz Scientific Company	Dual Desk for Class 01 to 05	37,120	12,109.50	449,504,640.00	4,500,000.00	6	

M. Nae

M. Nae
26/3/2019



GOVERNMENT OF SINDH
SCHOOL EDUCATION & LITERACY DEPARTMENT

CANCELLATION NOTICE

PROCUREMENT OF SCHOOL FURNITURE FOR PUBLIC SECTOR SCHOOLS

Reference:

Notice Inviting Tender published in daily newspapers; Dawn, Jang, and Kawish on 17th February, 2019 (INF-KRY No. 800/2019) and hoisted on the websites at www.sindheducation.gov.pk and ppms.pprasinhd.gov.pk at ID # T01319-18-0001 dated 18th February, 2019 for Procurement of School Furniture for Public Sector Schools.

It is to inform all the bidders that the bidding process of aforementioned NIT has been cancelled in terms of Rule-25 of SSP Rules, 2010 (Amended upto date). The bidders may collect their bid security(ies) from the office address, mentioned below, on any working day during office hours.

Section Officer (G-I)
School Education & Literacy Department
Government of Sindh
1st Floor, Tughlaq House, Kamal Attaturk Road
Sindh Secretariat, Karachi
Tel # 92-21-99213483

INF-KRY No. 1921/19

Say No to Corruption

ہم دہشتگردی کے خلاف متحد ہیں

Dawn - 18-4-2019