

30th September, 2023

TL2023/0930/1A

Jus. R Maqbool Baqar,
Caretaker Chief Minister Sindh &,
Chairman NICVD Board,
Government of Sindh,
Karachi

Subject: Complaint on summary sent on 21st February 2023 to former Sindh Chief Minister Syed Murad Ali Shah by the provincial health department (seven months back) for the appointment of a new Executive Director to the National Institute of Cardiovascular Diseases (NICVD), was never tabled before him for approval by the CM House staff, and even to the caretaker Chief Minister

Dear Sir,

Transparency International Pakistan has received another complaint on the summary sent on 21st February 2023 to former Sindh Chief Minister Syed Murad Ali Shah by the provincial health department seven months back for the appointment of a new Executive Director to the National Institute of Cardiovascular Diseases (NICVD), was never tabled before him for approval by the CM House staff, and even to the Caretaker Chief Minister.

The complainant has made the following allegations:

That;

1. On 4th January 2023, the Sindh High Court, hearing the NICVD corruption case C.P No. D-3463 of 2019 & C.P No. D-5143 of 2020, reprimanded the health secretary and said that he had destroyed the health system of the province, and also rebuked NICVD Executive Director Nadeem Qamar for occupying a government position after his retirement.

The judges also remarked on how Dr. Nadeem Qamar had come back to hold an official position after his retirement. "You should have surrendered the position by yourself. A member of the NICVD Governing Board requested the court to give three months to decide the policy. The court questioned why the government wanted to make a policy decision when the NICVD Act existed and asked, how will you fix it in three months.

The Court said "You talk about the supremacy of the law? then establish the rule of law in everything," Justice Panhwar said. Addressing Health Secretary Kazim Jatui, the court said that he had destroyed the health system of the province.



2. However, on 30th August 2022, Govt. of Sindh constituted a selection committee for appointment of Executive Director, NICVD, Karachi vide Services General Administration & Coordination Department (SGA&CD) (Annex-A).

Mr. Hasan Naqvi, Chairman Planning & Development Board, was appointed as Chairman of the Committee, and other 4 members included Mr. Kazim Jatoi, Secretary Health, and Secretary (services) SAG&D.

3. The maximum age for contract appointment as per Government Rules is 65 years, and for 4 year contract, applicant shall be less than 61 years (Annex-B). However, the scrutiny committee constituted to scrutinize documents and shortlist candidates in light of the terms and conditions set in the advertisement for the post of ED, NICVD illegally declared Dr. Nadeem Qamar within maximum age despite him being over age (Annex-C).
4. On 21st February 2023, the Selection Committee sent the summary to the Chief Minister Sindh and proposed that Prof. Tahir Saghir may be appointed as the Executive Director, NICVD, Karachi for a period of four years on the prescribed terms and conditions of the NICVD Act. (Annex-D).
5. The summary sent to former Sindh Chief Minister Syed Murad Ali Shah by the provincial health department for the appointment of a new executive director to the National Institute of Cardiovascular Diseases (NICVD) on 21.2.2023 was never tabled before him by the previous Principal Secretary for approval by the CM deliberately.
6. The present Principal Secretary to CM, Mr. Hasan Naqvi, who was also the Chairman of the Selection Committee has also not tabled the Summary for approval of Caretaker CM since one month.
7. The Caretaker Health Minister Dr. Saad Khalid Niaz has also said he would discuss it with the Caretaker CM.

In Rules, in any of the PSE in Federal Government and Provincial Government, no officer above 65 years age can be appointed. On 7 November 2018, Supreme Court declared appointment of Atta-ul-Haq Qasmi as Managing Director and Chairman of Pakistan Television as illegal and without any lawful effect, one reason being over age limit of 65 years, and that Rs197m shall be recovered from ex-PTV Chairman, former ministers & others.

Similarly on 16 January 2021, the Federal Cabinet removed Mr. Naeem Bukhari as Chairman Pakistan Television (PTV) as he was above 65 years and in light of the Islamabad High Court (IHC) order in a petition challenging the PTI leader's appointment. The IHC had earlier restrained Naeem Bukhari from working as Chairman of the PTV. A single bench led by IHC Chief Justice Athar Minallah had announced the decision while hearing a set of petitions challenging Bukhari's appointment citing it a violation of 2018 Supreme Court order in a similar case.

8. Dr. Nadeem Qamar is known to be drawing over Rs 6 million as monthly emoluments, and since last 17 months, approx. over Rs 100 million irregularly are paid by NICVD, needs to be recovered from him and others, as was decided by Supreme Court in 2018 in MD PTV case.



9. NICVD has also consistently violated SPPRA Rules 2010. As per SPPRA Rules 2010, Rule no. 11, detailed Procurement Plan of all contracts to be awarded in the fiscal year 2023-24, are to be posted on SPPRA website, indicating against each the method of procurement, scheduled month of procurement, and amount of procurement (Annex-E). However, NICVD ED Dr. Nadeem Qamar has failed to abide by SPPRA Rules and Rs 16 billion budget did not provide the individual project/procurement, in violation of SPPRA Rule No 11 and Rule No. 12, which prohibits splitting or combining contracts as mentioned in the declared Procurement Plan (Annex-F)

TI Pakistan's Comments

Transparency International Pakistan has reviewed the allegations of the complaint, prima facie, the allegations seem to be correct.

Following are TI Pakistan comments:

1. On 24th August, 2023, TI Pakistan has written to the office of the Caretaker Chief Minister, Sindh on the Complaint on the Violation of Orders Passed by the Honorable High Court of Sindh through Deliberate Delay in the Appointment of Executive Director of NICVD and Non-approval of the Summary moved by the Selection Committee Constituted under Chairman Planning & Development Board, Govt of Sindh, Pending with the Chief Minister Office for last over 6 months, since 21st February 2023 (Annex-G).
2. The delay in approval of the Selection Committee recommendations is not only a violation of SHC Orders of January 2023 in NICVD corruption case C.P No. D-3463 of 2019 & C.P No. D-5143 of 2020, but is also against the Rule of Law. It also raises concerns of deliberate delay as PSCM was himself Chairman of the selection Committee, to continue the services of ED on acting basis when the selection committee has proposed final name for the appointment as ED of NICVD.
3. Any violation of SPPRA Rules 2010 amounts to Mis-Procurement under Rule No 33 A.

TI Pakistan's Recommendations

Transparency International Pakistan requests the caretaker Chief minister Sindh to look into the allegations including attempts to make wrong statement on the age of Dr. Nadeem Qamar, and if found correct, to take decision on the summary pending since February 2023 on the appointment of the Executive Director NICVD, in light of the summary of the Selection Committee Constituted by the Govt. of Sindh on the appointment of Executive Director NICVD, and take action against those responsible for illegally declaring candidate within maximum age.

Transparency International Pakistan is striving for across the board application of **Rule of Law**, which is the only way to stop corruption, and achieve against Zero tolerance against corruption.

Regards


Advocate Daniyal Muzaffar,
Trustee/Legal Advisor
Transparency International Pakistan

Copies forwarded for the information with request to take action under their mandate to:

1. Principal Secretary to Caretaker PM, Prime Minister House, Islamabad
2. Caretaker Minister, Ministry of Health Sindh, Karachi
3. Chief Secretary, Govt of Sindh, Karachi
4. Secretary, Health Department, Govt of Sindh, Karachi
5. Chairman, NAB, Islamabad
6. Registrar, Sindh High Court, Karachi

Note:

This is to clarify that Transparency International Pakistan is not the complainant. It acts as whistleblower and operate under Article 19-A, of the Constitution of Pakistan which gives the right to public to know how government is being run by public officers. Article 19-A makes the right to access of information pertaining to a public authority a fundamental right, Justice Syed Mansoor Ali Shah in his landmark judgment in case of *Ataullah Malik v. Federation of Pakistan* includes following order;

Right to information is another corrective tool which allows public access to the working and decision making of the public authorities. It opens the working of public administration to public scrutiny. This necessitates transparent and structured exercise of discretion by the public functionaries. Article 19-A empowers the civil society of this country to seek information from public institutions and hold them answerable. PLD 2010 Lahore 605.



**GOVERNMENT OF SINDH
SERVICES, GENERAL ADMINISTRATION
AND COORDINATION DEPARTMENT**

Karachi, dated the 30th August, 2022

NOTIFICATION

No.SOII(SGA&CD)3-10/2018: In supersession of this department's notification of even number dated 01.08.2022, a Selection Committee is hereby re-constituted for the appointment of Executive Director (BS-21 equivalent), National Institute of Cardiovascular Diseases (NICVD), Karachi on contract basis with the following composition and Terms of Reference :-

1.	Chairman, Planning & Development Board	Chairman
2.	Secretary (Services), SGA&CD	Member
3.	Secretary, Health Department	Member/Secretary
4.	Professor / Associate Professor of Cardiology, Dow University of Health Sciences, Karachi to be nominated by Vice Chancellor of the said University.	Member
5.	Dr. Aamir Hameed Khan, Professor of Medicine and Consultant Cardiology, Agha Khan University Hospital (AKUH) Karachi	Co-opted Member

Terms of Reference:

- To prepare and approve the draft advertisement for hiring of Executive Director, NICVD Karachi".
- To scrutinize the application of the candidates.
- To call upon the shortlisted candidates and conduct their interviews.
- To select the most suitable candidate keeping in view professional and legal requirement of the post of Executive Director, National Institute of Cardiovascular Diseases (NICVD), Karachi; and
- To make recommendations for appointment of suitable candidates against the post of Executive Director, National Institute of Cardiovascular Diseases (NICVD), Karachi to the competent authority.

**DR. MUHAMMAD SOHAIL RAJPUT
CHIEF SECRETARY SINDH**

No.SOII(SGA&CD)3-10/2018

Karachi, dated the 30th August, 2022

A copy is forwarded for information & necessary action to: -

- The Chairman (P&D) Board, Government of Sindh, Karachi.
- The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Sindh, Karachi
- The Principal Secretary to Governor, Sindh, Karachi.
- The Principal Secretary to Chief Minister, Sindh, Karachi.
- The Secretary, Law Department, Government of Sindh, Karachi.
- All Administrative Secretaries, Government of Sindh, Karachi
- (including Members, Board of Revenue, Sindh).
- The Chairman, Chief Minister's Inspection, Enquiries & Implementation Team, Sindh, Karachi.
- The Chairman, Enquiries & Anti-Corruption Establishment, Sindh, Karachi.
- The Secretary, Provincial Ombudsman (Mohtasib) Secretariat, Sindh, Karachi.
- The Accountant General, Sindh, Karachi.
- The Inspector General Police, Sindh, Karachi.
- The Commissioner, (All), Sindh.
- The Consultant to Chief Secretary Sindh for Courts, Karachi.
- The Publisher, Sindh Government Printing Press, Karachi
- The Private Secretary to Chief Secretary, Sindh, Karachi.
- Officer concerned.
- Office Order File.



Mansoor Ahmed Lakhan
(MANSOOR AHMED LAKHAN) 30.8.2022
SECTION OFFICER-II

- v). The Performance Evaluation Committee subject to satisfactory performance review of the incumbent may recommend to the appointing authority for extension in the contract of the incumbent.

5. Terms and Conditions:

S. No.	Description	MP-I	MP-II	MP-III
1.	Required Educational Qualification and Experience	Ph.D in relevant subject(s) with 14 years-professional experience or Masters in relevant subject(s) with 18 years post qualification experience in the relevant field.	Ph. D in relevant subject(s) with 10 years post qualification professional experience in the relevant field or Masters in relevant subject(s) with 14 years post qualification experience in the relevant field,	Ph. D in relevant subject(s) with 06 years post qualification professional experience in the relevant field or Masters in relevant subject(s) with 10 years post qualification experience in the relevant field.
2.	Age Limit	Minimum=45 Maximum=62 (to be calculated as on the closing date of submission of applications)	Minimum=40 Maximum=62 (to be calculated as on the closing date of submission of applications)	Minimum=35 Maximum=62 (to be calculated as on the closing date of submission of applications)
3.	Tenure of contract	Initially for a period of three (03) years further extendable for a maximum period of two (02) years on annual (yearly) basis subject to satisfactory performance.	Initially for a period of three (03) years further extendable for a maximum period of two (02) years on annual (yearly) basis subject to satisfactory performance.	Initially for a period of three (03) years further extendable for a maximum period of two (02) years on annual (yearly) basis subject to satisfactory performance.
4.	Termination of contract	On completion of tenure or one month's notice from either side. In case of notice by the concerned Ministry/Division, it shall be after approval of the appointing authority. In case of proceedings under para-6 (viii & ix) of the policy ibid, the condition of one month's notice shall not be required.	On completion of tenure or one month's notice from either side. In case of notice by the concerned Ministry/Division, it shall be after approval of the appointing authority. In case of proceedings under para-6 (viii & ix) of the policy ibid, the condition of one month's notice shall not be required.	On completion of tenure or one month's notice from either side. In case of notice by the concerned Ministry/Division, it shall be after approval of the appointing authority. In case of proceedings under para-6 (viii & ix) of the policy ibid, the condition of one month's notice shall not be required.

5.	Leave	The incumbent shall earn leave on full pay @ 3 days per month on annual basis and the leaves earned shall be availed during the currency of the year. Title of Leave will neither be carried over to the next year in case of non-availing nor will it be encashed.	The incumbent shall earn leave on full pay @ 3 days per month on annual basis and the leaves earned shall be availed during the currency of the year. Title of Leave will neither be carried over to the next year in case of non-availing nor will it be encashed.	The incumbent shall earn leave on full pay @ 3 days per month on annual basis and the leaves earned shall be availed during the currency of the year. Title of Leave will neither be carried over to the next year in case of non-availing nor will it be encashed.
6.	Discipline	As applicable in case of contract employees.	As applicable in case of contract employees.	As applicable in case of contract employees.
7.	Appointing Authority	Prime Minister on the recommendations of the Selection Committee. Annual extension in contract will also be given by Prime Minister on recommendations of Performance Evaluation Committee.	Prime Minister on the recommendations of the Selection Committee. Annual extension in contract will also be given by Prime Minister on recommendations of Performance Evaluation Committee.	Prime Minister on the recommendations of the Selection Committee. Annual extension in contract will also be given by Prime Minister on recommendations of Performance Evaluation Committee.

6. **Miscellaneous:**

- i). Unless any other law/ rules, for the time being in force, provide otherwise, regular Civil Servant / Government Servants shall not be substantively posted against MP Scale Positions.
- ii). Civil Servants / Government Servants may, however, subject to eligibility, apply for these positions, through proper channel.
- iii). Subject to provisions of (i) above, in case a Civil Servant/ Government Servant is selected through competitive process against any such position, he/she shall either resign from Government Service or seek early retirement, severing his / her connection / lien with their parent cadre / Ministry /Division / organization, etc., before joining the MP Scale Position.
- iv). The persons being employed under MP Scales shall submit to the government an affidavit declaring their non-involvement in any other relevant business /job which may tantamount to conflict of interest.

NS

ii. Dr. Badaruddin Shaikh
Member/Secretary
 Special Secretary (Development)
 Health Department

iii. Mr. Abdul Hanan Shaikh
Member
 Deputy Secretary (Services)
 SGA&CD, Govt. of Sindh

02. After recitation from the Holy Quran, the chair welcomed the participants and informed that the candidates who failed to provide some documentary proofs have provided the missing documents. The sub-committee, therefore, scrutinized the documents and short-listed the candidates in the light of terms and conditions set in the advertisement published for the post of Executive Director, NICVD, Karachi. The summary of the credentials/ CVs of the applicants and recommendations of the sub-committee are given below:

S.#	Name of the applicant	Whether applied within due date	Whether within maximum age	Whether meets qualification criteria	Whether PMDC is valid	Domicile / PRC attached with the application	Whether Possesses Required Experience	Remarks
1.	Prof. Dr. Tariq Ashraf, S/o Mr. Muhammad Ashraf	Yes (05-09-2022)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Short-listed for interview
2.	Dr. Khalida Soomro (T.I) D/o M. Ali Soomro	Yes (08-09-2022)	No (over-age)	Equivalence certificate from HEC is missing	Yes	PRC Form-D is missing	Yes	Disqualified (doesn't meet criteria of age)
3.	Prof. Tahir Saghir S/o Saghir Alam	Yes (08-09-2022)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Short-listed for interview
4.	Dr. Syed Ishtiaq Rasool S/O Ziauddin	yes (08-09-2022)	Yes	Equivalence certificate from HEC is missing	Yes	Yes	Supporting document for management experience is missing	Not Short-listed (Did not provide Equivalence certificate from HEC & proof of management experience)
5.	Dr. Muhammad Nawaz Lashari, S/O Ghulam Haider Lashari,	Yes (09-09-2022)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Short-listed for interview
6.	Prof. Amin Khuwaja S/o Madad Ali Khuwaja	Yes (12-09-2022)	Yes	No FCPS (Anasthesia)	Yes	Yes	No experience is the field of Cardiology	Disqualified
7.	Prof. Nadeem Qamar S/o Qamar uz Zaman Shah	Yes (12-09-2022)	Yes	Equivalence certificate from HEC is missing	Yes	Yes	Yes	Not Short-listed (Did not provide Equivalence certificate from HEC)

03. In view of the above, the sub-committee unanimously decided that the short-listed candidates may be referred to the Selection Committee notified vide Notification No. SOII(SGA&CD) 3-17/2022, dated: 30th August, 2022 for interview / further necessary action.

04. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to all the members.



SUMMARY FOR CHIEF MINISTER, SINDH

SUBJECT: APPOINTMENT OF EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF CARDIO VASCULAR DISEASES (NICVD), KARACHI

It may kindly be recalled that the Honourable High Court of Sindh, Karachi had directed the Competent Authority to appoint the administrators and managers of Sindh Institute of Cardiovascular Diseases (SICVD), Karachi and National Institute of Cardiovascular Diseases (NICVD), Karachi vide order dated: 16.03.2022 (*Annexure-I*).

2. With the approval of Competent Authority i.e., Honourable Chief Minister Sindh, a Selection Committee for appointment of Executive Director, NICVD, Karachi WAS notified by Services General Administration & Coordination Department (SGA&CD), Govt. of Sindh on 30.08.2022 (*Annexure-II*). Subsequently, the Health Department, Government of Sindh published the advertisement, duly vetted by the Selection Committee, to invite applications from aspirant candidates. In response, **seven (07)** candidates applied for appointment on the said post and out of which **three (03)** were shortlisted for interview.

3. Accordingly, a meeting of Selection Committee under the Chairmanship of Chairman Planning & Development Board, Govt. of Sindh conducted interviews of the shortlisted candidates, which was held on 02.02.2023. The Selection Committee interviewed the shortlisted candidates and their cumulative score is as follows (*Annexure-III*):

S.#	Name of Candidate	Marks Obtained (out of 100)	Rank
01.	Prof. Tahir Saghir	77	1 st
02.	Prof. Tariq Ashraf	67	2 nd
03.	Prof. Muhammad Nawaz Lashari	62	3 rd

4. In view of the above, the Selection Committee proposes that Prof. Tahir Saghir may be appointed as Executive Director, NICVD, Karachi for a period of four years on the prescribed terms & conditions of the NICVD Act.

5. The Honourable Chief Minister, Sindh may kindly like to pass orders as deemed appropriate.

Z. A. Shah
21/2/23

(ZULFIQAR ALI SHAH)
SECRETARY TO GOVT. OF SINDH

6. MINISTER HEALTH & POPULATION WELFARE SINDH — Away —

7. CHIEF SECRETARY, SINDH *[Signature]*
21/2/23

8. CHIEF MINISTER, SINDH

Secretary Health Office,
Govt. of Sindh
Diary No: 5254
Dated: 17-2-23

17/02/23

20/2/23



ANNUAL PROCUREMENT PLAN FOR FINANCIAL YEAR 2023-24

(Under Rule 8 & 9 of the Public Procurement Rules 2004)

Name of Procuring Agency: **ALLAMA IQBAL OPEN UNIVERSITY, ISLAMABAD**

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
S/No	Name of Procurement (Description)	Estimated Cost (Rs.) (In Millions)	Procurement Method	Tentative Date of Procurement Notice Publication	Tentative Date of Award of Contract	Tentative Date of Completion	Remarks (if any)
1	Procurement of Furniture & Fixtures (Various Packages)	79.98	Open Competitive Bidding	Dates w.r.t. to each package are given below			-
1.1 (R):	Main Campus, Islamabad	7.29	Single Stage-One Envelope	Oct-23	Dec-23	Jun-24	Closed Framework Agreement
1.2 (D):	ICT Extension Building at Main Campus, Islamabad	14.38	Single Stage-Two Envelope	Jul-23	Sep-23	Dec-23	Invitation for Bids (IFB) was published on 21-07-2023
1.3 (D):	ORIC, PD & IET Blocks at Main Campus, Islamabad	4.81	Single Stage-One Envelope	Sep-23	Nov-23	Jan-24	-
1.4 (D):	Boarding & Lodging Complex at Main Campus, Islamabad	3.50	Single Stage-One Envelope	Sep-23	Nov-23	Jan-24	-
1.5 (D):	Regional Centres	10.00	Single Stage-One Envelope	Oct-23	Dec-23	Mar-24	-
1.6 (D):	New buildings of RC Kalat, RC Sargodha, RC Sahiwal and RC Attock	32.00	Single Stage-One Envelope	Oct-23	Dec-23	Mar-24	-
1.7 (D):	Regional Office Gilgit	8.00	Single Stage-One Envelope	Oct-23	Dec-23	Mar-24	-
2	Procurement of IT & Office Equipment (Various Packages)	155.47	Open Competitive Bidding	Dates w.r.t. to each package are given below			-
2.1 (R):	Main Campus, Islamabad	22.76	Single Stage-One Envelope	Sep-23	Nov-23	Jan-24	-
2.2 (D):	Main Campus, Islamabad and Regional Centres	20.00	Single Stage-One Envelope	Sep-23	Nov-23	Jan-24	-
2.3 (D):	Desktop PCs for Labs and Laptops for Faculty/ Officers for Main Campus & Regional Centres	40.00	Single Stage-One Envelope	Oct-23	Dec-23	Feb-24	-
2.4 (D):	ICT Extension Building at Main Campus, Islamabad	26.30	Single Stage-One Envelope	Sep-23	Nov-23	Jan-24	-
2.5 (D):	ORIC, PD & IET Blocks at Main Campus, Islamabad	15.31	Single Stage-One Envelope	Sep-23	Nov-23	Jan-24	-
2.6 (D):	Boarding & Lodging Complex at Main Campus, Islamabad	0.10	Single Stage-One Envelope	Sep-23	Nov-23	Jan-24	-
2.7 (D):	New Buildings of RC Kalat, RC Sargodha, RC Sahiwal and RC Attock	24.00	Single Stage-One Envelope	Oct-23	Dec-23	Feb-24	-
2.8 (D):	Regional Office Gilgit	7.00	Single Stage-One Envelope	Oct-23	Dec-23	Feb-24	-
3 (D)	Strengthening of Science Labs at Main Campus, Islamabad and Regional Campuses (Phase-II)	100.00	Single Stage-One Envelope	Oct-23	Dec-23	Mar-24	-
4 (R)	Procurement of Consumable Items for Print Production Unit	25.00	Single Stage-One Envelope	Sep-23	Nov-23	Jun-24	Closed Framework Agreement
5 (R)	Procurement of Laboratory Chemicals, Glassware & Consumables for Biology and Chemistry Department	7.50	Single Stage-One Envelope	Sep-23	Nov-23	Jun-24	Closed Framework Agreement
6 (R)	Procurement of Electrical Items, Electrical Power Cables, Paint Items, Carpentry Items and Plumbing Items	27.00	Single Stage-One Envelope	Sep-23	Nov-23	Jun-24	Closed Framework Agreement

RAFIQUI (H J) SHAHEED ROAD, KARACHI.
Procurement Plan for the year 2023-2024
SUMMARY

S.NO	DESCRIPTION OF PROCUREMENT	Estimated Budget Amount of 2022-2023	Estimated Budget Amount of 2022-2023	Funds Allocated (In Million)	Sources of Fund	Proposed Procurement Method	Timing of Procurement				Remarks	
							1st Qtr	2nd Qtr	3rd Qtr	4th Qtr		
					Govt Sindh & Self Genrated							
1	Stationery & printing Materials	100588800	100.59		*-----do-----*		25.15	25.15	25.15	25.15	100.60	Consumption given from Store department. Addition of 30% from previous value
2	General items Materials	394057300	394.06		*-----do-----*		98.51	98.51	98.51	98.51	394.04	Consumption given from Store department. Addition of 30% from previous value
	Linen Material	95721600	95.72		*-----do-----*		23.93	23.93	23.93	23.93	95.72	Consumption given from Store department. Addition of 30% from previous value
	Chemical for Laboratories	416263900	416.26		*-----do-----*		104.07	104.07	104.07	104.07	416.28	Consumption given from Store department. Addition of 30% from previous value
	DRUGS & MEDICINE	1262070471	1,262.07		*-----do-----*		315.52	315.52	315.52	315.52	1,262.08	Consumption given from Store department. Addition of 30% from previous value
	SURGICAL & DISPOSABLES	2482980189	2,482.98		*-----do-----*		620.75	620.75	620.75	620.75	2,483.00	Consumption given from Store department. Addition of 30% from previous value
	MEDICAL GASES	67500000	67.50		*-----do-----*		16.88	16.88	16.88	16.88	67.52	Consumption given from Store department. Addition of 30% from previous value
	DISPOSABLE ITEM FOR ANGIO LAB	6106067670	6,106.07		*-----do-----*		1,526.52	1,526.52	1,526.52	1,526.52	6,106.08	Consumption given from Store department. Addition of 30% from previous value
	Equipment required in replacement	1600000000	1,600.00		*-----do-----*		400.00	400.00	400.00	400.00	1,600.00	Consumption given from Store department. Addition of 30% from previous value
	GENERAL TYPE EQUIPMENT REQUIRED BY WARD/UNIT TIME TO TIME	320000000	320.00		*-----do-----*		80.00	80.00	80.00	80.00	320.00	Consumption given from Store department. Addition of 30% from previous value
	Reparing of Machinery & Equipment, Accessories and spares to run the Dept.	393787170	393.79		*-----do-----*		98.45	98.45	98.45	98.45	393.80	Consumption given from Store department. Addition of 30% from previous value
	HOSPITAL SOLUTION FOR CATH LAB	429000000	429.00		*-----do-----*		107.25	107.25	107.25	107.25	429.00	Consumption given from Store department. Addition of 30% from previous value
	Various Department Required Furniture	92057320	92.06		*-----do-----*		23.01	23.01	23.01	23.01	92.04	Consumption given from Store department. Addition of 30% from previous value
	Diet Charges	160000000	160.00		*-----do-----*		40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	160.00	Consumption given from Store department. Addition of 30% from previous value
	MARKETING & SOCIAL MEDIA ,ADVERTISMENT,ADS,TVC MARKETING	245000000	245.00		*-----do-----*		61.25	61.25	61.25	61.25	245.00	Consumption given from Store department. Addition of 30% from previous value
	Reparing of Furniture	1300000	1.30		*-----do-----*		0.33	0.33	0.33	0.33	1.32	Consumption given from Store department. Addition of 30% from previous value
	Hospital Maintenance Budget(Civil+Mechanical+Electrical+Contract Jobs)	1000050000	1,000.05		*-----do-----*		250.01	250.01	250.01	250.01	1,000.04	Consumption given from Store department. Addition of 30% from previous value

AS PER SPRA RULES 15.16

Total	15,166,444,420.30	15166
Total Purchasing Amount in Ruppess	Fifteen Billion SixteenCrore and Sixty Four Lac (Approx)	

Handwritten signature and date: 05/16/23

Head of Stores

Handwritten signature
Head of Procurement

Handwritten signature
Chief Operating Officer

Handwritten signature: CFO

24th August, 2023

TL2023/0824/2A

Justice (R) Maqbool Baqar,
 Caretaker Chief Minister Sindh,
 Government of Sindh,
 Karachi.

Subject: Complaint on the Violation of Orders Passed by the Honorable High Court of Sindh through Deliberate Delay in the Appointment of Executive Director of NICVD and Non-approval of the Summary moved by the Selection Committee Constituted under Chairman Planning & Development Board, Govt of Sindh, Pending with the Chief Minister Office for last over 6 months, since 21st February 2023.

Dear Sir,

Transparency International Pakistan has received a complaint on the allegations of violation of Orders Passed by the Honorable High Court of Sindh through deliberate delay in the Appointment of Executive Director of NICVD and Non-approval of the Summary moved by the Selection Committee Constituted under Chairman Planning & Development Board, Govt of Sindh, pending with the Chief Minister Office for last over 6 months since 21st February 2023.

The complainant has made the following allegations:

That;

1. The Honorable High Court of Sindh, Karachi had directed the Competent Authority to appoint the administrators and managers of Sindh Institute of Cardiovascular Diseases (SICVD), Karachi and National Institute of Cardiovascular Diseases (NICVD), Karachi.
2. On 30th August 2022, Govt. of Sindh constituted a selection committee for appointment of Executive Director, NICVD, Karachi vide Services General Administration & Coordination Department (SGA&CD).
3. Subsequently, the Health Department, Government of Sindh published the advertisement, duly vetted by the Selection Committee, to invite applications from aspirant candidates. In response, seven (7) candidates applied for appointment on the post of the Executive Director, out of which three (03) were shortlisted for interview.
4. On 2nd February 2023, the Selection Committee under the Chairmanship of Chairman Planning & Development Board, Govt. of Sindh conducted interviews of the shortlisted candidates, and prepared the report on cumulative score as follow:

S.#	Name of Candidate	Marks Obtained (Out of	Rank
-----	-------------------	------------------------	------



		100)	
1.	Prof. Tahir Saghir	77	1 st
2.	Prof. Tariq Ashraf	67	2 nd
3.	Prof. Muhammad Nawaz Lashari	62	3 rd

5. On 21st February 2023, the Selection Committee sent the summary to the Chief Minister Sindh and proposed that Prof. Tahir Saghir may be appointed as the Executive Director, NICVD, Karachi for a period of four years on the prescribed terms and conditions of the NICVD Act.
6. However, the Chief Minister Sindh has failed to take decision for seven months on the pending summary sent by the selection committee for the appointment of the Executive Director, NICVD to pave the way for the continuation of the service of Dr. Nadeem Qamar illegally.
7. The caretaker CM Sindh Justice R Maqbool Baqar on 19th August said that **Rule of Law**, conviction, and commitment were prerequisites for the improvement of the governance and the government system. How it would be achieved is the question to which he replied 'by following the constitution.'

Transparency International Pakistan's Comments;

Transparency International Pakistan has reviewed the allegations of the complaint, prima facie, the allegations seem to be correct.

Following are TI Pakistan comments:

1. On 13th September 2022, TI Pakistan has written to the Principal Secretary Prime Minister vide letter No. TL22/0913/1A on the complaint on the allegation of violation of Supreme Court of Pakistan order in the biased advertisement for the post of Executive Director, National Institute Cardiovascular Diseases (NICVD) and recommended to order cancelation of the advertisement and restart of the process of appointment of ED NICVD and that the selection criteria in the advertisement is drafted to benefit Dr. Nadeem Qamar such as age limit of 65 years as maximum for application, whereas in all Government Department of Sindh and Federal Government maximum age of such positions is 65 years, and Dr Nadeem is already 64 years old. Also no salary /allowances are declared in the Advertisement for the post, which he was paid over Rs 66 lakhs/month (**Annex-A**).
2. On 31st October 2022, vide No. TL22/1031/1A TI Pakistan has written another letter to the Minister Health, Govt. of Sindh on the complaint against the Irregularities in the Appointments/Promotions of Officers in NICVD Hospital identified by Director General Audit, causing a loss of approx. Rs.69 million for the year 2020-21 (Rs 345 million in 5 years) to National Exchequer and allegation of misappropriation of Rs. 927.049 million of Doubtful transfer of funds from bank account (**Annex-B**).
3. The affairs of the NICVD are being run on acting charge basis since last 15 months since 10th May 2022, despite the directions of the selection committee on the appointment of a regular full time Executive Director, which against the principle of **Rule of Law**.



4. The delay in approving Selection Committee recommendations is not only the violation of SHC Orders of March 2023, but is also against the Rule of Law, to continue the services of ED on acting basis when the selection committee has proposed final name for the appointment as ED of NICVD.

TI Pakistan's Recommendations

Transparency International Pakistan requests the Caretake Chief Minister Sindh to look into the allegations, and if found correct, to take decision on the pending of February 2023 summary on the appointment of the Executive Director NICVD in light of the summary of the Section Committee Constituted by the Govt. of Sindh on the appointment of Executive Director NICVD.

Transparency International Pakistan is striving for across the board application of **Rule of Law**, which is the only way to stop corruption, and achieve against Zero tolerance against corruption.

Regards

Advocate Daniyal Muzaffar,
Trustee/Legal Advisor
Transparency International Pakistan

Copies forwarded for the information with request to take action under their mandate to:

1. Principal Secretary to Caretaker PM, Prime Minister House, Islamabad
2. Caretaker Minister, Ministry of Health Sindh, Karachi
3. Chief Secretary, Govt. of Sindh, Karachi
4. Chairman, NAB, Islamabad
5. Registrar, Sindh High Court, Karachi

Note:

This is to clarify that Transparency International Pakistan is not the complainant. It acts as whistleblower and operate under Article 19-A, of the Constitution of Pakistan which gives the right to public to know how government is being run by public officers. Article 19-A makes the right to access of information pertaining to a public authority a fundamental right, Justice Syed Mansoor Ali Shah in his landmark judgment in case of Ataulah Malik v. Federation of Pakistan includes following order;

Right to information is another corrective tool which allows public access to the working and decision making of the public authorities. It opens the working of public administration to public scrutiny. This necessitates transparent and structured exercise of discretion by the public functionaries. Article 19-A empowers the civil society of this country to seek information from public institutions and hold them answerable. PLD 2010 Lahore 605.