13th September, 2023

Barrister Murtaza Wahab,
Mayor Karachi
 Karachi Metropolitan Corporation (KMC)
 Karachi.

Sub: Complaint on the Allegations of Violation of SPPRA Rules 2010 in Request for Proposal (RFP) Selection of Consultants for Planning and Design and Construction Supervision of Roads, Bridges, Flyovers, Underpasses, Storm Water Drainage System, Buildings for Various Projects in Mega City of Karachi

Dear Sir,

Transparency International Pakistan has received a complaint on the allegations of violation of SPPRA Rules 2010 in the Selection of Consultants for Planning and Design and Construction Supervision of Roads, Bridges, Flyovers, Underpasses, Storm Water Drainage System, Buildings for Various Projects in Mega City of Karachi.

The complainant has made the following allegations:

That;

1. Karachi Metropolitan Corporation (KMC) Engineering Department has issued Request for Proposal (RFP) for Consultancy Services for Planning and Design and Construction Supervision of Roads, Bridges, Flyovers, Underpasses, Storm Water Drainage System, Buildings etc. of various Projects and execute Umbrella Contract Agreement, on 2nd August 2023 (Annex-A).


3. Under the RFP, the Technical Proposal Format and Content required from the participating firms/consultants require consultants to submit the following information in violation of SPPRA Rules 2010:
   a. Bidders must provide average Annual Turnover for last 3 years (in million rupees) of Consultancy - 25 points (Attach Audit Reports & Financial Statement) (Annex-C).

4. This information is in violation of SPPRA SBD for Consultants dated 21-1-2012, as RFP Documents for Selection of Consultants do not require financial information from the consultants.

5. Additionally, SPPRA Rules 2010 require all procurements to be a part of the Annual Procurement Plans of the procuring agency which shall also be posted on SPPRA website, in July 2023. However, Karachi Metropolitan Corporation (KMC) Contract Management, Municipal Services Department, Annual Procurement Plan for 2023-2024 (Updated on 18.08.2023) does not contain procurements under the subject RFP of KMC i.e. Consultancy Services for Design and Construction Supervision of Roads, Bridges, Flyovers, Underpasses, Water Supply Lines, Sewerage System, Storm Water Drainage System, Buildings for various Projects in Karachi (Annex-D).
Transparency International Pakistan's Comments

Transparency International Pakistan has reviewed the allegations of the complaint, prima facie the allegations seem to be correct.

Following are TI Pakistan comments:

1. SPPRA Request for Proposals Documents for Selection of Consultants Date Sheet require the following from the consultants, quoted below (Annex-E)

   **Option A**
   Criteria, sub-criteria, and point system for the evaluation of Full Technical Proposals are:
   (i) Specific experience of the Consultants relevant to the assignment
   (ii) Adequacy of the proposed methodology and work plan in responding to the Terms of Reference
   (iii) Key professional staff qualifications and competence for the assignment
   (iv) Suitability of the transfer of knowledge (training) program
   (v) Participation by nationals among proposed key staff

   **Option B**
   Criteria, sub-criteria, and point system for the evaluation of Simplified Technical Proposals are:
   (vi) Adequacy of the proposed methodology and work plan in responding to the Terms of Reference
   (vii) Key professional staff qualifications and competence for the assignment

2. It may be noted that for the consultancy work, there is no requirement regarding financials and annual turnover of the previous assignments undertaken by the consultants, therefore the requirement of average Annual Turnover for last 3 years in KMC RFP appears to be in violation of SPPRA Rules 2010.

3. As per SPPRA Rules 2010, Rule 11 Procurement Plan, procuring agencies are required to prepare an annual or a longer-term rolling plan for all proposed procurements, quoted below (Annex-F)

   **SPPRA Rule 11: Procurement Plan** – All procuring agencies shall devise a mechanism for planning in detail for all proposed procurements, determining the requirement of the procuring agency, within its available resources and prepare an annual or a longer-term rolling plan, detailing the procurement methods applicable for specific procurements.

4. If the allegations on the above violations are correct, the subject procurement may deemed to be declared as Mis-Procurement under SPPRA Rule No 32 (A) 1 (b), quoted below:

   **SPPRA Rule 32(A) 1(b):** The Authority may take notice of any material violation of provisions of the Act, Rules, Regulations, Orders, Instructions or any other law relating to public procurement and declare the case to be of mis-procurement if such violation has been established.

Transparency International Pakistan Recommendations

Transparency International Pakistan requests the Mayor Karachi to review the allegations of the complaint in light of the SPPRA Rules 2010 and if found correct issue directives to the Engineering Department, KMC to amend RFP to ensure that the selection criteria outlined in subject RFP is in line
with the SPPRA requirements of selection of consultants, and ensure compliance with SPPRA Rules 2010, Rule 11, to avoid mis-procurement under Rule SPPRA Rules 2010, Rules 32(A) 1(b).

Transparency International Pakistan is striving for across the board application of Rule of Law, which is the only way to stop corruption, and achieve Zero tolerance against corruption.

With Regards,

(Advocate Daniyal Muzaffar)
Trustee/Legal Advisor
Transparency International Pakistan

Copies forwarded for the information with request to take action under their mandate to:

1. Caretaker CM, Govt of Sindh, CM House, Karachi
2. Chief Secretary, Government of Sindh, Karachi
3. Chairman, National Accountability Bureau (NAB), Islamabad
4. Director General, National Accountability Bureau (NAB), Karachi
5. Registrar, High Court of Sindh, Karachi

Note:

This is to clarify that Transparency International Pakistan is not a complainant, it acts as a whistleblower and operate under Article 19-A, of the Constitution of Pakistan which gives the right to public to know how government is being run by public officers. Article 19-A makes the right to access of information pertaining to a public authority a fundamental right, Justice Syed Mansoor Ali Shah in his landmark judgment in case of Ataullah Malik v. Federation of Pakistan includes following order.

Right to information is another corrective tool which allows public access to the working and decision making of the public authorities. It opens the working of public administration to public scrutiny. This necessitates transparent and structured exercise of discretion by the public functionaries. Article 19-A empowers the civil society of this country to seek information from public institutions and hold them answerable. PLD 2010 Lahore 605.
REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL


Karachi Metropolitan Corporation (KMC) intends to hire/engage a Consultant (Engineering Organization or Firm) having valid Pakistan (PEC) Registration Certificate in relevant field along with enlistment on Active Taxpayers List of Federal Board of Revenue and meet eligibility criteria provided in RFP Document.

Proposal can be downloaded from SPPRA Website or the same can be purchased from the office of Director General, Karachi Metropolitan Corporation (KMC) during working hours and working days on written request accompanied a paid order amounting to Rs.5,000/- (non-refundable) in favour of Director General, Karachi Metropolitan Corporation (KMC).

Proposal Meeting will be held on 24th August 2023 at 1400 hours in the office of the Director Contract at Old SBCA Building Ground Floor, behind Civic Center & adjacent to KW&SB main office Gulshan-e-Iqbal. Proposal will be carried out by adopting Single Stage Two Envelopes Procedure. The proposals completed in accordance with instructions provided in RFP Document, in sealed envelope should reach on or before 30th August in the office of Director General (Technical), Karachi Metropolitan Corporation (KMC) and be accompanied by consultancy Services for Planning and Design and Construction Supervision of Roads, Bridges, Flyovers, Water Drainage System, Buildings etc. for various projects in Karachi.

Consultants are required to submit their proposal strictly in accordance with the Instructions to Consultants (ITC) and RFP Notice. Proposals must be prepared hardbound binding form to deny the possibility of addition.

Proposal shall be opened on the same day at 1430 hrs, whereas the Financial Proposals of Technical shall be opened after Technical Evaluation. Other details are provided in RFP.

Proposals must be free from unsolicited and/or incorrect information are liable to legal action and/or disqualification. Information is also available on SPPRA Website.

Karachi Metropolitan Corporation reserves the right to reject all the proposals as per SPPRA Rules.

Director General
(technical Services)
Karachi Metropolitan Corporation
CORRIGENDUM

Subject: NOTICE FOR EXTENSION OF DATE OF SUBMISSION OF RFP

Reference: DESIGN & CONSTRUCTION SUPERVISION OF ROADS, BRIDGES, ELYOVERS, UNDERPASSES, WATER SUPPLY LINES, SEWERAGE SYSTEM, STORM WATER DRAINAGE SYSTEM, BUILDINGS FOR VARIOUS PROJECTS IN KARACHI

Due to some modifications in the RFP Documents the submission of the Proposals scheduled to be opened on 30-08-2023 has been extended to the next date 14-09-2023.

Modified RFP documents will be available in the office of the Director General (Technical Services), KMC during office hours.

This issue with the approval of Competent Authority, KMC.

[Signature]

Director Accounts / Secretary (Member) Selection Committee Engineering Department, KMC

NOTICE BOARD

All Participating Consultancy Firms

CC to:
1. Director General (Technical Services), KMC.
2. All Committee Members.
3. Secretary to Mayor, KMC.
4. Office File.
Criteria, sub-criteria, and point system

(i) Average Annual Turnover for last 3 years (in million rupees) of Consultancy (Attach Audit Reports & Financial Statement)  
   | Points |
   |------------------|-------|
   | Rs. 700 and above | 25 Marks |
   | Rs. 500 to 700    | 15 Marks |
   | Rs. 300 to 500    | 10 Marks |
   | Rs. 100 to 300    | 05 Marks |
   | Less than 100     | 0 Marks  |

(ii) Specific experience of the Consultants relevant to the Design and Construction Supervision of Roads, Bridges, Flyovers, Underpasses, Storm Water Drainage System and Buildings in last five years. 
(Attach Completion Certificate)  
   | Points |
   |------------------|-------|
   | Eight & more Projects | 30 numbers |
   | Five Projects       | 20 numbers |
   | Three Projects      | 10 numbers |
   | Less than two projects | 0 number |

(iii) Adequacy of the proposed methodology and work plan in responding to the Terms of Reference:  
   | Points |
   |------------------|-------|
   | a) Technical approach and Methodology | 0 - 5 |
   | c) Work plan | 0 - 5 |
   | d) Organization and staffing | 0 - 5 |

(iv) Key professional staff qualifications and competence for the assignment  

a) Principal Architect  
   PCATP Valid Registration with  
   Bachelor or Master Degree in relevant field  
   Masters Degree with 20 years Experience 5.0 points  
   Masters Degree with 15 years Experience 3.0 points  
   Masters Degree with 10 years Experience 2.0 points  
   Less than 10 years experience 0.0 point  
   OR  
   Bachelor Degree with 25 years Experience 5.0 points  
   Bachelor Degree with 20 years Experience 3.0 points  
   Bachelor Degree with 15 years Experience 2.0 points  
   Less than 15 years experience 0.0 point  

b) Principal Structural Engineer  
   PEC Valid Registration with  
   Bachelor or Master Degree in relevant field  
   Masters Degree with 20 years Experience 5.0 points  
   Masters Degree with 15 years Experience 3.0 points  
   Masters Degree with 10 years Experience 2.0 points  
   Less than 10 years experience 0.0 point  
   OR
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S#</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Quantity</th>
<th>Estimated Unit Cost</th>
<th>Estimated Total Cost</th>
<th>Fund Allocated</th>
<th>Source of Funds</th>
<th>Proposed Procurement Method</th>
<th>Timing of Procurements</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Operation &amp; Maintenance with HIP Seniors of 1/121 citizen complaint information system for KMC (Head Office)</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>50.00 Million</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>1st Qtr</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Supply of 100 Nos. reusable Full Face Respirator Mask (Cartridge Type) DVP 400 Nos. Combustible P-100 Filter, Complying with International Standards EN13 998 Class: 1 A EN1563 B for Five Brigades Department, KMC</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>19.90 Million</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>2nd Qtr</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Provision of 04 Nos. Mobile Lighting Towers CAV Bus &amp; Generators for Five Brigades Department, KMC.</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>20.00 Million</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>3rd Qtr</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Supply of All-Weather Resistant AFFF Connectors for Karachi Five Brigades Department, KMC.</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>20.00 Million</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>4th Qtr</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Provision of Fire Fighting Accessories for Five Brigades Department, KMC.</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>20.00 Million</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>1st Qtr</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Supply of Five Hoses to Five Brigades Department, KMC.</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>16.000 Million</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>2nd Qtr</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Provision of SCBA for Fire Fighting Operations in Karachi</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>20.00 Million</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>3rd Qtr</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sr No</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Quality</td>
<td>Estimated Cost (Approximately)</td>
<td>Source of Funds</td>
<td>Proposed Procurement Method</td>
<td>Timing of Procurement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Re-gratification of Hardware Infrastructure for Payroll, IT, KMC (Phase-I)</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>18,000 Million</td>
<td>Omitted AOP 2023</td>
<td>Single Stage One Envelope</td>
<td>1st Qtr</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Establishment of District Record Site (Nawabshah Campus Site) for IT, KMC (Phase-II)</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>18,000 Million</td>
<td>Omitted AOP 2023</td>
<td>Single Stage One Envelope</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Construction of Boundary Wall at Qutub-ud-Din Graveyard, Orangi, Karachi, District West, Municipal Services Department, KMC</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>1,955 Million</td>
<td>KMC</td>
<td>Single Stage One Envelope</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Repair &amp; Maintenance of Delwari Graveyard, Municipal Services Department, KMC</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>1,955 Million</td>
<td>KMC</td>
<td>Single Stage One Envelope</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Construction of Improvement at Internal Road in Chakra Ghori Graveyard, Hurangi, KMC, District East, Municipal Services Department, KMC</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>1,956 Million</td>
<td>KMC</td>
<td>Single Stage One Envelope</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Section 2. Information to Consultants – Data Sheet

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>covered in the foregoing.</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>15.1</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6.3</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>16.2</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 13.1 Choose only one of the below options:

**Option A**

Criteria, sub-criteria, and point system for the evaluation of Full Technical Proposals are:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| (i) Specific experience of the Consultants relevant to the assignment: [0 - 10]  
*Since all consultants have been shortlisted based on experience, ideally their experience should not be rated normally less than satisfactory, that is, not less than 70 percent.* |
| (ii) Adequacy of the proposed methodology and work plan in responding to the Terms of Reference:  
a) Technical approach and methodology [Insert points]  
b) Work plan [Insert points]  
c) Organization and staffing [Insert points]  
Total points for criterion (ii): [20 - 50] |
| (iii) Key professional staff qualifications and competence for the assignment:  
a) Team Leader [Insert points]  
b) [Insert position or discipline as appropriate] [Insert points]  
c) [Insert position or discipline as appropriate] [Insert points]  
d) [Insert position or discipline as appropriate] [Insert points]  
e) [Insert position or discipline as appropriate] [Insert points]  
Total points for criterion (iii): [30 - 60] |

The number of points to be assigned to each of the above positions or disciplines shall be determined considering the following three sub criteria and relevant percentage weights:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1) General qualifications [Insert weight between 20 and 30%]  
2) Adequacy for the assignment [Insert weight between 50 and 60%]  
3) Experience in region and language [Insert weight between 10 and 20%]  
Total weight: 100% |

(iv) Suitability of the transfer of knowledge (training) program:  
[Normally not to exceed 10 points. When transfer of knowledge is a particularly important component of the assignment, more than 10 points may be allocated; the...
### Section 2. Information to Consultants – Data Sheet

#### Option B

Criteria, sub criteria, and point system for the evaluation of Simplified Technical Proposals are:

- **(i)** Adequacy of the proposed technical approach, methodology and work plan in responding to the Terms of Reference:\[20–40\]

- **(ii)** Key professional staff qualifications and competence for the assignment:

  a) Team Leader \[Insert points\]
  b) [Insert position or discipline as appropriate] \[Insert points\]
  c) [Insert position or discipline as appropriate] \[Insert points\]
  d) [Insert position or discipline as appropriate] \[Insert points\]
  e) [Insert position or discipline as appropriate] \[Insert points\]

  Total points for criterion (ii): \[60–80\]

The number of points to be assigned to each of the above positions or disciplines shall be determined considering the following three subcriteria and relevant percentage weights:

- 1) General qualifications \[Insert weight between 20 and 30%\]
- 2) Adequacy for the assignment \[Insert weight between 30 and 60%\]
- 3) Experience in region and language \[Insert weight between 10 and 20%\]

  Total weight: 100%

Total points for the two criteria: 100

When sub criteria are provided, which is always the case for “adequacy of the proposed methodology and work plan” and “qualifications and competence of key staff”, for practical reasons the number of sub-criteria should be kept to a minimum (typically no more than three for each criterion).

Since sub criteria and their weighting determine the outcome of the evaluation, they should be chosen considering the aspects that are critical to the success of the assignment.

Evaluation criteria and sub-criteria, associated points, and the rating system form an arithmetic model to assess the technical merit of the proposals.

---

1 Consideration may also be given to the number of pages submitted as compared to the number recommended under para. 3.4 (c) (ii) of these Instructions.
All adopted sub-criteria should be specified in the RFP. The points allocated to each of the sub-criteria under "qualifications and competence of key staff" must be indicated in the RFP.

The minimum technical score St required to pass is: ______ Points [Insert number of points]

Remuneration Type (Insert either 'Time Based' or 'Lump Sum'):

The single currency for price conversions is:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>20.1</th>
<th>Expected date and address for contract negotiations:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>24.2</td>
<td>Successful consultant is required to submit performance security in form of pay order, demand draft or bank guarantee (PA shall insert amount but not more than 10% of the contract amount).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Consultant undertake to sign Integrity Pact for the procurement estimated to exceed Pak Rs.2.5 million.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Part II – PROCUREMENT OF GOODS, WORKS AND RELATED SERVICES

PROCUREMENT PLANNING

11. Procurement Plan

(1) Mandatory Provision of Procurement Plan - All procuring agencies shall devise a mechanism for planning in detail for all proposed procurements, determining the requirement of the procuring agency, within its available resources, and prepare an annual or a longer term rolling plan, detailing the procurement methods applicable for specific procurements;

(2) Review and Update - The procurement plan prepared for any project shall be reviewed and updated throughout the life of the project, such as estimates of time requirements, availability of funds, assumptions about institutional capacity, changing priorities and other factors that require plan adjustments for the success of the project. Such required adjustments will not invalidate the plan if made for improving the plan in the interests of the successful and timely completion of the project.

12. Limitation on Splitting or Regrouping of Proposed Procurement

(1) Save as otherwise provided and subject to the regulations made by the Authority, a procuring agency shall prepare, in accordance with Rule 11 above, all proposed procurements for each financial year and shall proceed accordingly without any splitting or regrouping of the procurements already grouped, allocated and scheduled in the Procurement Plan;

(2) The annual or longer rolling plan, as the case may be, thus prepared, will be posted in advance on the Authority’s website as well as on website of the procuring agency, in case the procuring agency has its own website.

13. Specifications

(1) Specifications shall allow the widest possible competition and shall not favour any single contractor or supplier nor put others at a disadvantage. Specifications shall be generic and shall not include references to brand names, model numbers, catalogue numbers or similar classifications. However, if the procuring agency is convinced that the use of a reference to a brand name or a catalogue number is essential to complete an otherwise incomplete specification, such use or reference shall be qualified with the words “or equivalent”.

(2) Procurement of used or reconditioned equipment, plant or machinery is not permissible in any case whatsoever.

14. Approval Mechanism - All procuring agencies shall provide clear authorization and delegation of powers for different categories of procurement and shall only initiate procurements once approval of the competent authorities concerned has been accorded.