



June 27, 2024

TIP24/0627/1A

Managing Director
SPPRA Sindh
Karachi

Subject: Complaint against violation of SPPRA Rules 2010, Office of the Director General, Parks and Horticulture Department Tender Ref: DG/P&H/KMC/624/24

Dear Sir,

Transparency International Pakistan has received a complaint from M/s Kamran Enterprise against violation of SPPRA Rules 2010, Office of the Director General, Parks and Horticulture Department Tender Ref: Dir (CM)ED/KMC/03/2023-24 (Annex-A)

The complainant has made the following allegations:

That,

1. The Parks and Horticulture Department invited tender Ref: DG/P&H/KMC/624/24 dated 16 April 2024 for 30 works (Annex-B).
2. Out of 30 works, M/s Kamran Enterprise offered bids in 07 works, whereas M/s Kamran Enterprise was the lowest in the 05 works. The financial bid was opened on 23 May 2024.
3. In the matter of Work No. 07, KMC DG/P&H/KMC/07/2023-2024, concerning the improvements of different parks in District South, there were 04 total bidders. The estimated cost for this work was set at PKR 20 million. M/s Kamran Enterprise submitted a bid of PKR 160,000,000.04, which was 19.9999998% below the estimated cost, and the lowest among all bidders. Despite this, M/s Kamran Enterprise was ranked as the 4th lowest bidder (Annex-C).
4. In the matter of Work No. 11, KMC DG/P&H/KMC/11/2023-2024, concerning the Improvement of back portion of Burns Garden, there were 04 total bidders. The estimated cost for this work was set at PKR 20 million. M/s Kamran Enterprise submitted a bid of PKR 160,000,000.05, which was 19.9999975% below the estimated cost, and the lowest among all bidders. Despite this, M/s Kamran Enterprise was ranked as the 4th lowest bidder (Annex-D).
5. In the matter of Work No. 14, KMC DG/P&H/KMC/14/2023-2024, concerning the Development of Front portion of Aziz Bhatti Park after removal of enactment University Road, there were 06 total bidders. The estimated cost for this work was set at PKR 20 million. M/s Kamran Enterprise submitted a bid of PKR 160,000,000.04, which was 19.9999998% below the estimated cost, and the lowest among all bidders after tie of two bidders. Despite this, M/s Kamran Enterprise was ranked as the 3rd lowest bidder (Annex-E).
6. In the matter of Work No. 16, KMC DG/P&H/KMC/16/2023-2024, concerning Improvement of Beautification of Sharah-e-Faisal, there were 07 total bidders. The estimated cost for this work was set at PKR 20 million. M/s Kamran Enterprise submitted a bid of PKR 160,000,000.04, which was 19.9999998% below the estimated cost, and the lowest among all bidders after tie of three bidders. Despite this, M/s Kamran Enterprise was ranked as the 4th lowest bidder (Annex-F).
7. In the matter of Work No. 18, KMC DG/P&H/KMC/18/2023-2024, concerning Rehabilitation/improvement internals road in Hill Park (P&H) Deptt, there were 08 total bidders. The



estimated cost for this work was set at PKR 20 million. M/s Kamran Enterprise submitted a bid of PKR 160,000,000.03, which was 19.99999985% below the estimated cost, and the lowest among all bidders. Despite this, M/s Kamran Enterprise was ranked as the 4th lowest bidder (Annex-G).

8. Mr. Zohaib Magsi (AAO) was not included in the procurement committee, however, he signed illegally on all the BER of 30 works which is a violation of SPPRA Rules (Annex-H).

Transparency International Pakistan's Comments

Transparency International Pakistan has reviewed the allegations of the complaint, prima facie the allegations seem correct. Following are TI Pakistan comments:

1. As per SPPRA Regulations for Procurement of Works notified in 2011, Clause 11.3.4, bids more than 20% below the Engineers' estimate may be rejected as quoted below:

Clause:11.3.4 - In case tenders are invited on the items of Composite Schedule of Rates, where contractor has to quote the premium on Schedule B, then its item wise and total premium shall not be below the Engineer's Estimate by 20%. In this case, the Procuring Agency can reject that particular bid(s) or float tender afresh, if deemed appropriate (Annex-I)

2. In case the Procuring Agency receives more than one bid at 20 % low either in total or in BOQ rates, the bids must be rejected and retendered.
3. In all the 05 works, the offered bid of M/S Kamran Enterprise is lowest and not below than 20% of the estimated cost.
4. The signing of BERs by Mr. Zohaib Magsi who is not part of the procurement committee is in contravention to SPPRA Rules 2010.

Transparency International Pakistan Recommendations

TI Pakistan requests MD SPPRA to examine the allegations of the complaint, and if found correct, issue directives to the concerned department to award contracts in compliance with SPPRA Rules 2010, to avoid mis-procurement.

Transparency International Pakistan is striving for across the board application of Rule of Law, which is the only way to stop corruption, and achieve against Zero tolerance against corruption.

Regards


Advocate Daniyal Muzaffar,
Trustee/Legal Advisor
Transparency International Pakistan

Copies forwarded for the information with request to take action under their mandate to:

1. Chief Minister, Govt. of Sindh, Karachi
2. Chief Secretary, Govt. of Sindh, Karachi
3. Mayor Karachi, KMC Office, Karachi
4. Director General, Parks and Horticulture, KMC, Karachi
5. Registrar, High Court of Sindh, Karachi

Note:

This is to clarify that Transparency International Pakistan is not a complainant, it acts as a whistleblower and operate under Article 19-A, of the Constitution of Pakistan which gives the right to public to know how



government is being run by public officers. Article 19-A makes the right to access of information pertaining to a public authority a fundamental right, and a three member bench in case of Mukhtar Ahmad Ali vs the Registrar, Supreme Court of Pakistan, Islamabad, headed by Chief Justice Qazi Faez Isa in the landmark judgment on 16 October 2023, in CP No. 3532/2023, has declared that

“What previously may have been on a need-to-know basis Article 19A of the Constitution has transformed it to a right-to-know, and the Access to information is no longer a discretion granted through occasional benevolence, but is now a fundamental right available with every Pakistani which right may be invoked under Article 19A of the Constitution”

Annex-A

Mobile: 0333-3696857

Phone: 021-32532264



KAMRAN ENTERPRISE

Govt. Approved Contractor, Civil Engineering Works, Builders & General Order Suppliers

Ref: KE/079/24

Date: 25-06-2024

بخدمت جناب چیئرمین سی آر سی برائے ٹینڈرز و ڈی جی پارکس صاحب

بلدیہ عظمیٰ کراچی، فریئر ہال کراچی

مجھے آپ کے دفتر کے کسی ملازم کے نمبر سے بذریعہ وائس اپ خط موصول ہوا ہے، بحوالہ لیٹر نمبر DG(P&H)KMC/298/2024 آج مورخہ 25-06-2024 کو بوقت ساڑھے تین بجے (03:30 pm) آپ کے دفتر میں سی آر سی کی میٹنگ ہے، مجھے تا حال کوئی آفیشل لیٹر موصول نہیں ہوا، جبکہ میں نے تمام درخواستیں آپ کے دفتر میں جمع کرائی ہیں یا TCS کے ذریعہ درخواست بھیجی ہے، آپ سے گزارش ہے کہ میں نے اپنے وکیل کو آگاہ کیا ہے انہوں نے میرے ساتھ میٹنگ میں شرکت کا اظہار کیا ہے، اس کے لئے انہیں میرے کاموں میں آنے والے فرسٹ لوٹ کھٹی کے ٹینڈرز کی کاپیاں اور کہنیوں نے جو ہر دفاتر جمع کرائی ہیں ان کی تمام فوٹو کاپیاں جاری کی جائیں، اس تمام کاپی کی فیس ادا کرنے کو تیار ہوں۔ اور کیونکہ میں کراچی کنسٹرکٹرز ایسوسی ایشن (سندھ) کا ممبر ہوں اور ایسوسی ایشن نے بھی آپ کو شکایتی خط لکھا ہے۔ ایسوسی ایشن کے نمائندوں (مہمدے داران) کو بھی بلا یا جائے، مین لوڈنگ ہوگی۔

میں نے تمام 30 درکس کے BER ایلوڈ کر کے کاپی بنالی ہے جس میں پروکیورمنٹ کمیٹی نے تمام 30 درکس میں سے کچھ درکس 20% سے زیادہ Below اور کچھ درکس جو کہ پینیاں Belwo Tie 20% آئی ہیں ان کو بھی کام ایوارڈ کر دیا ہے جو سراسر سہرا اور لڑکی خلاف ورزی ہے۔

جناب ذویب کھٹی (AAO) کا پروکیورمنٹ کمیٹی میں نام شامل نہیں ہے (سہرا کاپی منسلک) اس شخص نے اپنے منکرو نظر اور لاڈلے ٹھیکیداروں کو نوازنے کے لئے میرے ساتھ نا انصافی کی ہے اور تمام 30 درکس کی BER پر اس نے دستخط کئے ہیں جو سہرا اور لڑکی خلاف ورزی ہے۔

اس سی آر سی کی کمیٹی کی میٹنگ خط کے وصول ہونے اور ٹینڈرز کی اور کہنی ہر دفاتر کی فوٹو کاپی کی فراہمی تک طفر کی جائے، آپ کا شکر گزار ہوں گا۔

Yours Faithfully

M/s Kamran Enterprise

Copy to:

1. Managing Director SPPRA Sindh Karachi.
2. Karachi Constructors Association (Sindh)
3. Chairman Anticorruption, Sindh Karachi.
- ✓ 4. Chairman Transparency International Pakistan Karachi.

H. No. 7, 2nd Floor Bukhari Manzil 1542-A Madina Masjid Road Khadda, Karachi. 75660



**KARACHI METROPOLITAN CORPORATION
OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR GENERAL,
PARKS & HORTICULTURE DEPARTMENT**

Inside Bagh-e-Jinnah (Frere Hall) Fatima Jinnah Road Karachi ph # 021-99204300 Fax # 021-99204327.

SUB: NOTICE INVITING TENDERS

(As per SPPRA Guideline)

Tenders In sealed covers are invited on Schedule Rate plus Offer Rate Basis for the following works of Parks & Horticulture Department, KMC for the Financial Year 2023-2024:-

SN	Tender Reference Number.	Name of Schemes.	Estimate Cost (In Million)	Bid Security/ E.M (2%) (In Rs.)	Tender Cost (In Rs.)
1	DG/P&H/KMC/01/2023-2024	Arrangement of tools and equipments for parks and horticulture, KMC.	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
2	DG/P&H/KMC/02/2023-2024	Development of parks at block-15 F.B.Area..	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
3	DG/P&H/KMC/03/2023-2024	Development of family parks Gulshan-e-Iqbal block-5	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
4	DG/P&H/KMC/04/2023-2024	Development of parks at gulzar-e-Hijri.	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
5	DG/P&H/KMC/05/2023-2024	Improvement works at kidney hill Park (Ahmed Ali Park)	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
6	DG/P&H/KMC/06/2023-2024	Providing and fixing of lighting arrangement and irrigation system for different parks of district South (P&H) Deptt.	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
7	DG/P&H/KMC/07/2023-2024	Improvement of different parks of District South KMC	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
8	DG/P&H/KMC/08/2023-2024	Balance work of Tariq gorund / park F.B.Area Karachi	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
9	DG/P&H/KMC/09/2023-2024	Improvement and development of different civil works of Park at block-3 Clifton KMC	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
10	DG/P&H/KMC/10/2023-2024	Improvement of Hosh Muhammad Sheedi park Clifton	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
11	DG/P&H/KMC/11/2023-2024	Improvement of back portion of Burns Garden KMC	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
12	DG/P&H/KMC/12/2023-2024	Construction of floor store room and vehicles accessories at workshop Kersaz (P&H) Deptt. KMC	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
13	DG/P&H/KMC/13/2023-2024	Construction of internal pathways of family park Gulshan-E-Iqbal KMC	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
14	DG/P&H/KMC/14/2023-2024	Development of front portion of Aziz Bhatti Park after removal of encroachment University Road KMC.	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
15	DG/P&H/KMC/15/2023-2024	Development of lawns family park gulshan-e-Iqbal	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
16	DG/P&H/KMC/16/2023-2024	Improvement and Beautification of Shahrah-e-Faisal KMC	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
17	DG/P&H/KMC/17/2023-2024	Development of Lawns at Ahmed Ali Park (Kidney Hill Park)	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
18	DG/P&H/KMC/18/2023-2024	Rehabilitation / Improvement Internals road in Hill Park (P&H) Deptt. KMC	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
19	DG/P&H/KMC/19/2023-2024	Arrangement of lighting system at Ahmed Ali Park (Kidney Hill Park)	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000

SN	Tender Reference Number.	Name of Schemes.	Estimate Cost (In Million)	Bid Security/ E.M (2%) (In Rs.)	Tender Cost (In Rs.)
20	DG/P&H/KMC/20/2023-2024	Development of park at block-10 F.B.Area, KMC	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
21	DG/P&H/KMC/21/2023-2024	Development of ST-14 park at block-15 F.B.Area KMC.	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
22	DG/P&H/KMC/22/2023-2024	Development of Pak China friendship park Kashmir Road.	20.00	Rs.400000/-	5000
23	DG/P&H/KMC/23/2023-2024	Improvement of different parks and central island of district central KMC	10.00	Rs.200000/-	3000
24	DG/P&H/KMC/24/2023-2024	Providing and fixing of lighting arrangement and irrigation system for different parks of District East (P&H) Deptt. KMC	15.00	Rs.300000/-	4000
25	DG/P&H/KMC/25/2023-2024	Development and renovation work at Ameer Khusroo Park Clifton	10.00	Rs.200000/-	3000
26	DG/P&H/KMC/26/2023-2024	Development of Zafar Shah round about at New M.A. Jinnah Road, KMC.	10.00	Rs.200000/-	3000
27	DG/P&H/KMC/27/2023-2024	Improvement of back portion of Aziz Bhatti Park, KMC.	15.00	Rs.300000/-	4000
28	DG/P&H/KMC/28/2023-2024	Balance work of Azeem Shareef Park Nazimabad KMC.	5.00	Rs.100000/-	3000
29	DG/P&H/KMC/29/2023-2024	Development of nurseries in different district of KMC	10.00	Rs.200000/-	3000
30	DG/P&H/KMC/30/2023-2024	Development of ST-21 park at block-4 Clifton, KMC.	10.00	Rs.200000/-	3000

TERMS & CONDITIONS:-

1. Tender schedule shall be as follows:-

SCHEDULE	DATE & TIME	VENUE
1. Receiving of Application & Issuance of Tender	From the date of publication in newspapers To <u>22 / 05 /2024</u> 9.00 AM to 4.00 PM.	1. Office of the Director General Parks & Horticulture Deptt. KMC inside Bagh-e-Jinnah (Frere Hall) , Fatima Jinnah Road, Karachi and , 2. WEBSITE OF SPPRA (only Issuance of Tenders)..
2. Dropping of Tender	<u>23 / 05 / 2024</u> 2.00 p.m.	Office of the Director General Parks & Horticulture Deptt. KMC inside Bagh-e-Jinnah (Frere Hall) , Fatima Jinnah Road Karachi.
3. Opening of Tender.	<u>23 / 05 /2024</u> 3.00 p.m.	Office of the Director General Parks & Horticulture Deptt. KMC inside Bagh-e-Jinnah (Frere Hall) , Fatima Jinnah Road, Karachi.

2. The tender documents (Soft Copy of Terms & Conditions and Hard Copy of BOQ/Schedule-B will be Issued to the contractor on submission of written request on original letter head with copy of CNIC positively to Director General (P&H) KMC alongwith original documents with their attested photo copies as mentioned above and on payment of non-refundable cost of tender price through pay order from any schedule Bank of Karachi City only in favor of KMC. Bid Security in shape of pay order from any schedule Bank in favor of KMC (Note: All Pay orders must be in own name of firms/ contractor(s). as mentioned above should be enclosed with the bid otherwise the tender will be rejected. No tender will be sold on the tender opening date. The terms and conditions of the tender and contract/documents can also be downloaded from web site of KMC (www.karachicity.gov.pk). However the BOQ/Schedule-B shall must be purchased from the above mentioned offices on payment of the prescribed fee and within the specified time.

3. In case of any reason, if the tenders are not responded on the above dates the next date of submission and opening will be Dt. 11 / 06 /2024 and the tender documents will also be available for sale upto Dt. 10 / 06 /2024.
4. In Case the date of opening or last date of sale is declared as a public holiday by the Government, the next official working day shall be deemed to be the date for last date of sale and submission and opening of tenders at the same time as mentioned above. .
5. The total bid amount as well as the rates of items must be filled both in figures and words and in case any correction is made by the contractor himself then each correction must be initialed by the Contractor, otherwise the tenders are liable to be summarily rejected.
6. **Substantially Responsive Bid:-**
Only those bids, which comply with each of the minimum qualification requirements uploaded separately on KMCs' Website and attached with the tender documents shall be declared substantially responsive bids at the time of tender opening and will be eligible for further evaluation, otherwise the same will be declared as non responsive / rejected.
7. The bidders are required to submit the above information, the signed evidence against evaluation criteria along with their bids. However Joint Venture between two or more firms is allowed subject to compliance of conditions of stipulated rules of PEC.
8. If any fake documents are found then the tender is liable to be rejected/cancelled with out any compensation and with penalty as per rules.
9. Canvassing in connection with tenders is strictly prohibited and tenders submitted by the contractors who are reported canvassing will be liable for rejection.
10. If a bidder submits a seriously unbalanced bid then he will be required to deposit extra performance security to a level sufficient to protect the procuring agency against financial losses, failing which the submitted bid security will be forfeited by the procuring agency..
11. Bid security of the unsuccessful bidder shall be released once the contract has been finalized with the successful bidder or the validity period has expired..
12. The participants should have experience in relevant field i.e. mega / urban Parks & Horticulture works, Development, Improvement & maintenance field .
13. The participants will have to be submitted the details of machinery , garden tools, equipment and manpower along with the tender documents otherwise tender/tenders will be liable for rejection..
14. The procuring agency may reject all or any bid subject to the relevant provisions of SPPRA Rules 2010.
15. Bid validity period 90 days as per SPPRA Rule-38(i)
16. **RESPONSIVE BIDDERS IS REQUIRED TO SUBMIT FOLLOWING DOCUMENTS WITH BID:**
 - i. List of similar assignment/experiences with cost (mention number of projects with their cost)
 - ii. Details of equipments, machines and transport owned by firm/contractor.
 - iii. Financial Statement (summary) and Income Tax return for the last 10 years.
 - iv. Fresh Affidavit that firm has never been black listed.
 - v. Fresh Affidavit that the firm has not been involved in any Court case.
 - vi. If failed to submit the above information/documents the tender will be liable for rejection.
 - vii. CNIC valid attested copy.
 - viii. P.E.C.registered attested copy valid /renewed license of PEC Category CE-10

- ix. NTN Certificate
x. paid up challan of professional Tax prescribed Fee/Sindh Revenue Board Certificate attested copy.

The Parks and Horticulture Department, Karachi Metropolitan Corporation has reserved the right to accept or reject any or all tender/tenders without assigning any reasons.

DIRECTOR GENERAL
Parks and Horticulture
K.M.C.

Director (Media Management), K.M.C

Enclosed 10 copies with a request to publish is not more than three (03) prominent newspapers of English, Urdu and Sindhi.

Not to be published: O/W No.DG(P&H)/KMC/AAO/ 624 /2024 DT 16 /4 /2024.

Director (CB) SPPRA, GOS. (alongwith tender schedule documents forms)

With a request to upload on the web site of SPPRA (Authority). A soft copy is also enclosed issue ID Number.

Director/Sr.Dlr./DDO (Web) IT, Department, K.M.C.

With a request to upload on KMC web site

COPY TO:-


1. The P.S. to Hon'ble Mayor Karachi
2. The P.S. to M.C.,K.M.C.
3. F.A.,K.M.C.
4. Director (P&H),KMC.
5. Addl. Director (Tech.)civil (P&H) KMC.
6. Executive Engineer (Civil/M&E)P&H, KMC.
7. A.E.E.(M&E)P&H, KMC.
8. Dy.Director (P&H), KMC
9. D.A.O/A.A.O.(P&H), KMC
10. Notice Board .
11. Concerned relevant file..


BID EVALUATION REPORT


- 1 Name of Procuring Agency Karachi Metropolitan Corporation.
- 2 Tender Reference No: NITH DG/P&H/KMC/ / 624 /24, Dt. 16-04-2024
Work/ Item
- 3 Tender Description/Name of work Improvement of different parks of District South KMC
- 4 Method of Procurement Single Single- One Envelope Procedure
- 5 Tender Published Through newspapers/ website SPPRA No. NIT ID TO J253-230006
- 6 Total Bids documents Sold 08 Nos
- 7 Total Bids Received 04 Nos
8. Technical Bid Opening date (if applicable) Nil (provide details in separate form)
9. No. of Bid Technically qualified (if applicable) Nil.
- 10 Bid (s) Rejected Nil
- 11 Financial Bid Opening date 23-05-2024
- 12 Bid Evaluation Report:

Name of Firm or Bidders	Cost of offer/ Bidder	Ranking in terms of cost	Comparison with Estimated cost	Reasons for acceptance/ rejection	Remarks
1 M/s AHA Construction	15999489 74	1 st Lowest	@ Below the estimated cost <u>20.002665%</u>	Qualified as per evaluation criteria. <u>Below</u>	Recommended for award of work as per Procurement Committee
2 M/s Electroline engineers	15959839 96	2 nd Lowest	@ Below the estimated cost	Calculation mistake Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee
3 M/s W.S enterprises	16000600 175	3 rd lowest	@ Below the estimated cost	No affidavit and no documents Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee
4 M/s Kauran enterprise	16000000 043	4 th lowest	@ Below the estimated cost <u>19.999998%</u>	Rate high side Disqualified <u>Below</u>	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee

Recommendation The offered by bidder of Total Cost of Rs 15999489 74 (Rupees One core fifty nine lac ninety thousand four hundred eighty nine and paisa seventy four only) of M/s AHA Construction, Karachi is recommended by the Committee to award them work being the 1st lowest.


Asst. Admin Officer
Parks & Horticulture, KMC
(Member/Secretary)


Asst. Executive Engineer
Engineering Department KMC
(Member)



Asst. Director (Tech.) Civil
Parks & Horticulture, KMC
(Chairman) **Kha**


BID EVALUATION REPORT


- 1 Name of Procuring Agency: Karachi Metropolitan Corporation.
- 2 Tender Reference No: NIT# DG/P&H/KMC// 624 /24, Dt. 16-04-2024
Work/ Item
- 3 Tender Description/Name of work: Improvement of back portion of Burns Garden KMC
- 4 Method of Procurement: Single Single- One Envelope Procedure
- 5 Tender Published: Through newspapers/ website SPPRA No HIT ID TO 1253-230008
- 6 Total Bids documents Sold: 04 Nos
- 7 Total Bids Received: 04 Nos
- 8 Technical Bid Opening date (if applicable): Nil (provide details in separate form)
- 9 No of Bid Technically qualified (if applicable): Nil
- 10 Bid (s) Rejected: Nil
- 11 Financial Bid Opening date: 23-05-2024
- 12 Bid Evaluation Report:-

Sr	Name of Firm or Bidders	Cost of offered by Bidder	Ranking in terms of cost	Comparison with Estimated cost	Reasons for acceptance/ rejection	Remarks
1	M/s Pak electric works	15997760.61	1 st Lowest	@ Below the estimated cost 20.0113% Below	Qualified as per evaluation criteria.	Recommended for award of work as per Procurement Committee
2	M/s Adil Enterprises	15920813.70	2 nd Lowest	@ Below the estimated cost	Calculation mistake in total amount Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee
3	M/s Muhammad Sa eem	15921413.74	3 rd lowest	@ Below the estimated cost	Calculation mistake in total amount Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee
4	M/s Kamran enterprise	16000000.05	4 th lowest	@ Below the estimated cost 19.9999995% Below	Rate high side Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee

Recommendation. The offered by bidder of Total Cost of Rs. 15997760 61 (Rupees one crore fifty nine lac ninety seven thousand seven hundred sixty and paisa sixty one only) of M/s Pak Electric works, Karachi is recommended by the Committee to award them work being the 1st lowest.


Member (Secretary)
Parks & Horticulture, KMC


Asst. Executive Engineer
Engineering Department KMC
(Member)
Feroz Ahmad


Add. Director (Tech) Civil
Parks & Horticulture, KMC
(Chairman)


BID EVALUATION REPORT

Annex-E

1. Name of Procuring Agency: Karachi Metropolitan Corporation.
2. Tender Reference No: NITH DG/P&H/KMC/ / 624 /24, Dt. 16-04-2024
Work/ Item
3. Tender Description/Name of work Development of front portion of Aziz Bhatti Park after removal of encroachment University Road KMC.
4. Method of Procurement Single Single- One Envelope Procedure
5. Tender Published Through newspapers/website SPPRA No. NIT ID TO 1253 230008
6. Total Bids documents Sold 06 Nos
7. Total Bids Received 06 Nos
8. Technical Bid Opening date (if applicable) Nil (provide details in separate form)
9. No. of Bid Technically qualified (if applicable) Nil
10. Bid (s) Rejected Nil
11. Financial Bid Opening date 23-05-2024
12. Bid Evaluation Report:-

S#	Name of Firm or Bidders	Cost of offered by Bidder	Ranking in terms of cost	Comparison with Estimated cost	Reasons for acceptance/ rejection	Remarks
1	M/s Rajgan enterprises	16000000/-	1 st lowest <i>Tie</i>	@ Below the estimated cost <i>20% Below</i>	Qualified as per evaluation criteria.	Recommended for award of work as per Procurement Committee
2	M/s Kaman enterprise	16000000.04/-	3 rd lowest	@ Below the estimated cost <i>19,999,998/-</i>	Rate high side Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee
3	M/s Muhammad Saleem	16000000.1 <i>16000000/-</i>	2 nd Lowest <i>Tie</i>	@ Below the estimated cost <i>20% Below</i>	Correction in rate Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee
4	M/s Karbail enterprises	15597691/-	4 th lowest	@ Below the estimated cost	No sign no stamp Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee
5	M/s Steel Associates	17826517/-	5 th lowest	@ Below the estimated cost	Rate high side Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee
6	M/s Sadeh Al S Co	17820775.51	6 th lowest	@ Below the estimated cost	Rate high side Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee

Recommendation: The offered by bidder of Total Cost of Rs. 16000000/- (Rupees one crore and sixty lacs only) of M/s Rajgan Enterprises, Karachi is recommended by the Committee to award them work being the 1st lowest


Asstt. Executive Engineer
Parks & Horticulture KMC
(Member)


Asstt. Executive Engineer
Engineering Department KMC
(Member)


Add. Director (Tech.) Civil
Parks & Horticulture, KMC
(Chairman)

BID EVALUATION REPORT

1. Name of Procuring Agency: Karachi Metropolitan Corporation.
2. Tender Reference No: NIT# DG/P&H/KMC// 624 /24, Dt. 15-04-2024
3. Tender Description/Name of work: Improvement and Beautification of Shahrah-e-Faisal KMC
4. Method of Procurement: Single Single- One Envelope Procedure
5. Tender Published: Through newspapers/ website SPPRA No. NIT ID TO 1253-23C008
6. Total Bids documents Sold: 08 Nos
7. Total Bids Received: 07 Nos
8. Technical Bid Opening date (if applicable): Nil (provide details in separate form)
9. No. of Bid Technically qualified (if applicable): Nil.
10. Bid (s) Rejected: Nil
11. Financial Bid Opening date: 23-05-2024
12. Bid Evaluation Report:-

No	Name of Tender Bidders	Cost of offered by Bidder	Ranking in terms of cost	Comparison with Estimated cost	Reasons for acceptance/rejection	Remarks
1	M/s Muhammad Saleem	16000000/-	1 st Lowest <i>Tie</i>	@ Below the estimated cost <i>Tie 21</i>	Qualified as per evaluation criteria. <i>Below</i>	Recommended for award of work as per Procurement Committee
2	M/s Raigan Enterprises	16000000/-	2 nd Lowest <i>Tie</i>	@ Below the estimated cost <i>Tie 20</i>	Calculation mistake Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee
3	M/s Bakhsh Murtaza and bidifiers	15000000/-	3 rd lowest <i>Tie</i>	@ Below the estimated cost <i>Tie 20</i>	Withdraw letter attached Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee
4	M/s Raigan Enterprises	16000000.00	4 th lowest	@ Below the estimated cost <i>19,99,99,998</i>	Rate high side Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee
5	M/s Hesham Engineering	16141504/-	5 th lowest	@ Below the estimated cost	Rate high side Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee
6	M/s UR engg.	16000784/-	6 th lowest	@ Below the estimated cost	Correction in total amount calculation mistake Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee
7	M/s Mehran Khan Babar	17000503/-	7 th lowest	@ Below the estimated cost	Rate below side as per SPPRA Rules Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee

Recommendation: The offered by bidder of Total Cost of Rs.16000000/- (Rupees one crore and sixty lacs only) of M/s Muhammad Saleem, Karachi is recommended by the Committee to award them work being the lowest.


Asst Executive Engineer
Engineering Department KMC
(Member)


Asst Executive Engineer
Engineering Department KMC
(Member)


Add Director (Tech) Civil
Parks & Horticulture, KMC
(Chairman)


BID EVALUATION REPORT


- 1 Name of Procuring Agency: Karachi Metropolitan Corporation,
- 2 Tender Reference No Work/ Item: NIT# DG/P&H/KMC/ / 624 /24, Dt. 16-04-2024
- 3 Tender Description/Name of work: Rehabilitation / Improvement internal road In Hill Park (P&H) Deptt. KMC
- 4 Method of Procurement: Single Single- One Envelope Procedure
- 5 Tender Published: Through newspapers/ web site SPPAA No NIT ID 10 1253 230003
- 6 Total Bids documents Sold: 09 Nos
- 7 Total Bids Received: 08 Nos
8. Technical Bid Opening date (if applicable): Nil (provide details in separate form)
- 9 No. of Bid Technically qualified (if applicable): Nil
- 10 Bid (s) Rejected: Nil
11. Financial Bid Opening date: 23-05-2024

12. Bid Evaluation Report:-

S.N	Name of firm or Bidders	Cost of offered by Bidder	Ranking in terms of cost	Comparison with Estimated cost	Reasons for acceptance/ rejection	Remarks
1	M/s Al Umar Associates	15999999/-	1 st lowest	@ Below the estimated cost 20.000005% Below	Quoted as per evaluation criteria.	Recommended for award of work as per Procurement Committee
2	M/s Sunny Kh Enterprises	16000000/-	2 nd lowest Tie	@ Below the estimated cost 20% Below	Rate high side Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee
4	M/s Intech Engineering	16000000	3 rd lowest Tie	@ Below the estimated cost 20% Below	Rate high side Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee
5	M/s Kumbhar Enterprise	16000000.03	4 th lowest	@ Below the estimated cost 19.99999985% Below	Rate high side Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee
6	M/s Abu Salim and Enterprises	14939587/-	5 th lowest	@ Below the estimated cost	Very below Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee
8	M/s Maide Jareem co	16000000/-	6 th lowest Tie	@ Below the estimated cost 20% Below	Rate high side Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee
8	M/s Al Jazira	16000000	7 th lowest	@ Below the estimated cost	Rate high side Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee
8	M/s The wide shot Behar and Brothers	14000000	8 th lowest	@ Below the estimated cost	Rate very below Disqualified	Disqualified as per Procurement Committee

Recommendation: The offered by bidder of Total Cost of Rs.1,59,99,999/- (Rupees One Crore fifty nine lac ninety nine thousand nine hundred and ninety nine only) of M/s Al Umar Associates Karachi is recommended by the Committee to award them work being the 1st lowest.


Asst. Executive Engineer
Parks & Horticulture, KMC
(Member/Secretary)


Asst. Executive Engineer
Engineering Department KMC
(Member)


Asst. Director (Tech) Civil
Parks & Horticulture, KMC
(Chairman)



KARACHI METROPOLITAN CORPORATION

OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR GENERAL PARKS AND HORTICULTURE DEPARTMENT

Inside Bagh-e-Jinnah (Frere Hall), Fatima Jinnah Road, Karachi Cantt, Karachi Phone:99204300 Fax:99204327

No. DG(P&H)KMC/ 1351 /2024

Dated: 21.5 /2024

To,

The Manager Assessment-IV,
Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority,
Government of Sindh,
Barrack No. 8, Sindh Secretariat No. 4-A,
Court Road, Karachi.

NOTIFICATION

SUBJECT: CONSTITUTION OF PROCUREENT COMMITTEE.

Reference: Dir (Enfr-1)/0062/SPPRA/37-1(KMC)14-15/6436 dated 03.03.2015

In response to the above referred letter and with the approval from Competent Authority, the constitution of Procurement Committee of Parks and Horticulture Department, KMC which is comprising of the following officers:-

S.NO.	NAME	DESIGNATION	STATUS
1	Mr. Muhammed Rizwan Khan	Additional Director (Technical)	Chairman
2	Mr. Feroz Hassan	Asstt; Eexecutive Engineer Engineering Department, KMC	External Member
3	Mr. Muhammed Ali Memon	Accounts Officer, P&H, KMC	Secretary

Submitted for your kind information and perusal please.


DIRECTOR GENERAL
Parks & Horticulture
K.M.C.



Annex-I

Government of Sindh
Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority



NOTIFICATION

Subject: AMENDMENT IN SPPRA REGULATIONS FOR PROCUREMENT OF WORKS

In pursuance of the powers conferred under Section 27 of Sindh Public Procurement Act, 2009 and the decision of the SPPRA Board in its 42nd meeting through circulation of the agenda, the following amendments are made in clauses 11.3.3 and 11.3.4 of SPPRA Regulations for procurement of Works. The clauses may be read as under instead of existing:

Regulation Clause #	Amendment
Para 2 of 11.3.3	In case tenders are invited on the items of Composite Schedule of Rates, where contractor has to quote the premium on Schedule B, then its item wise and total premium shall not to exceed the Engineer's Estimate by 20%.
11.3.4	In case tenders are invited on the items of Composite Schedule of Rates, where contractor has to quote the premium on Schedule B, then its item wise and total premium shall not to be below the Engineer's Estimate by 20%. In this case, the Procuring Agency can reject that particular bid(s) or float tender afresh, if deemed appropriate.

2. This shall be enforced with immediate effect.

(Zubair Pervez Ahmed)
Managing Director

No. DD(HRF&CB)/SPPRA/2023-2024/12-23

Karachi, dated 13th June, 2024

Copy for information to:

1. The Principal Secretary to Governor Sindh.
2. The Principal Secretary to Chief Minister Sindh.
3. The Chairman, P&D Board, Government of Sindh.
4. The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Government of Sindh.
5. The Administrative Secretaries (All), Government of Sindh.
6. All Members of SPPRA Board.
7. The PS to Chairman, SPPRA Board.
8. The PS to Managing Director, SPPRA.

(Muhammad Abid)
Deputy Director (HRF&CB)