

**ALTAS YAPI SANAYI VE TEMİZLİK  
HİZMETLERİ TICARET ANONİM ŞİRKETİ,**  
Kuciikbakkalkoy Mah. Ebedi Sokak, No:16.  
Atasehir / Istanbul

**SUBJECT: CLARIFICATION ON TECHNICAL PROPOSAL SUBMITTED BY ALTAS YAPI  
SANAYI VE TEMİZLİK HİZMETLERİ TICARET ANONİM ŞİRKETİ IN  
RELATION TO ESTABLISHMENT OF PRIMARY AND SECONDARY SOLID WASTE  
COLLECTION SYSTEM FOR SUKKUR (SUKKUR MUNICIPAL CORPORATION  
JURISDICTION), INCLUDING ROHRI (MUNICIPAL COMMITTEE JURISDICTION)  
SINDH, PAKISTAN.**

Dear Sir,

I am directed to refer to the subject cited above and to state that Sindh Solid Waste Management Board ('Employer') invited the bids for the "Establishment of Primary and Secondary Solid Waste Collection System for Sukkur (Sukkur Municipal Corporation Jurisdiction), including Rohri (Municipal Committee Jurisdiction) Sindh, Pakistan".

2. The Bid submitted by **ALTAS YAPI SANAYI VE TEMİZLİK HİZMETLERİ TICARET ANONİM ŞİRKETİ ('Bidder')** is currently being evaluated by Technical Advisory Team. As per the *Annexure B* Technical and Financial Evaluation and Qualification Criteria 2.3 of the Request for Proposal (RFP) following was required:

*"Number of similar assignments with Capex in excess of USD 05 million in last 10 years",*

3. Upon evaluation of the Bid, we were unable to verify Capex amount in the contract letters provided. Therefore, We require you, **ALTAS YAPI SANAYI VE TEMİZLİK HİZMETLERİ TICARET ANONİM ŞİRKETİ**, to clarify your position on the aforementioned observation within three days positively.

4. Your early and timely response will be appreciated.

  
**(TARIQ ALI NIZAMANI)**  
Executive Director (F&P)

Copy forwarded for information to:

- 1) Secretary, Sindh Solid Waste Management Board, Karachi.
- 2) Transparency International Pakistan. Plot 72F/2, Floor-1, 9<sup>th</sup> Street, Jami Commercial, DHA, Phase-7, Karachi.
- 3) PS to Managing Director, SSWMB, Karachi.
- 4) M/s EY Ford Rhodes in consortium of M/s Akhund Forbes and Project Procurement International Technical Advisory Team (EY Ford Rhodes, Leading firm), Karachi.
- 5) Master File.

**Chongqing Endurance-ShinMaywa Industry Co. Ltd.,**  
No.6 Yangliu Road, Liangjiang New Area,  
Chongqing, China

**SUBJECT: CLARIFICATION ON TECHNICAL PROPOSAL SUBMITTED BY CHONGQING ENDURANCE-SHINMAYWA INDUSTRY CO. LTD. IN RELATION TO ESTABLISHMENT OF PRIMARY AND SECONDARY SOLID WASTE COLLECTION SYSTEM FOR SUKKUR (SUKKUR MUNICIPAL CORPORATION JURISDICTION), INCLUDING ROHRI (MUNICIPAL COMMITTEE JURISDICTION) SINDH, PAKISTAN.**

Dear Sir,

I am directed to refer to the subject cited above and to state that Sindh Solid Waste Management Board ('**Employer**') invited the bids for the "Establishment of Primary and Secondary Solid Waste Collection System for Sukkur (Sukkur Municipal Corporation Jurisdiction), including Rohri (Municipal Committee Jurisdiction) Sindh, Pakistan".

2. The Bid submitted by **Chongqing Endurance-ShinMaywa Industry Co. Ltd.** ('**Bidder**') is currently being evaluated by Technical Advisory Team. As per the Technical and Financial Evaluation and Qualification Criteria 1.2 stated in *Annexure B* of the Request for Proposal (RFP) following was required:

*"Company must have been maintaining / managing a workforce, for the last 5 years, as part of waste management operations."*

3. Upon evaluation of the Bid submitted by the Bidder, it was discovered that the Bidder had provided a list of workforces. However, the contracts provided indicate that they were signed in 2020, which does not comply with the minimum duration of 5 years for maintaining / managing a workforce, as part of waste management operations, as set out in the RFP.

4. Additionally, as per the Technical and Financial Evaluation and Qualification Criteria 1.3 stated in *Annexure B* of the RFP following was required

*"Should own or have managed Compactors, Arm Roll Trucks, Loaders, Excavators, Mini-tippers and Flatbed trucks for at least 5 years, as part of municipal solid waste management operations."*

5. Upon evaluation of the Bid submitted by the Bidder, it was discovered that the rental agreements were signed in July 2020, which does not comply with the requirement of minimum duration of 5 years for owning and managing relevant waste management operations vehicles, as set out in the RFP.

6. Furthermore, as per the Technical and Financial Evaluation and Qualification Criteria 2.3 stated in *Annexure B* of the RFP following was required:

*"Number of similar assignments with Capex in excess of USD 05 million in last 10 years",*

7. Upon evaluation of the Bid, we were unable to verify Capex amount in the contract letters provided. Therefore, we require you, Chongqing Endurance-ShinMaywa Industry Co. Ltd, to clarify your position on the aforementioned observations within three days positively:

8. Your early and timely response will be appreciated.

  
**(TARIQ ALI NIZAMANI)**  
Executive Director (F&P)

Copy forwarded for information to:

- 1) Secretary, Sindh Solid Waste Management Board, Karachi.
- 2) Transparency International Pakistan. Plot 72F/2, Floor-1, 9<sup>th</sup> Street, Jami Commercial, DHA, Phase-7, Karachi.
- 3) PS to Managing Director, SSWMB, Karachi.
- 4) M/s EY Ford Rhodes in consortium of M/s Akhund Forbes and Project Procurement International Technical Advisory Team (EY Ford Rhodes, Leading firm), Karachi.
- 5) Master File.

**Country Garden Manguo Environmental Technology Group Co. Ltd.,**  
North of New 206 National Road, East to Lvbo Avenue, Weizi Street,  
Changyi, Weifang City, Shandong Province, China

**SUBJECT: CLARIFICATION ON TECHNICAL PROPOSAL SUBMITTED BY COUNTRY GARDEN MANGUO ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGY GROUP CO. LTD. IN RELATION TO ESTABLISHMENT OF PRIMARY AND SECONDARY SOLID WASTE COLLECTION SYSTEM FOR SUKKUR (SUKKUR MUNICIPAL CORPORATION JURISDICTION), INCLUDING ROHRI (MUNICIPAL COMMITTEE JURISDICTION) SINDH, PAKISTAN.**

Dear Sir,

I am directed to refer to the subject cited above and to state that Sindh Solid Waste Management Board ('Employer') invited the bids for the "Establishment of Primary and Secondary Solid Waste Collection System for Sukkur (Sukkur Municipal Corporation Jurisdiction), including Rohri (Municipal Committee Jurisdiction) Sindh, Pakistan".

2. The bid submitted by **Country Garden Manguo Environmental Technology Group Co. Ltd., ('Bidder')** is currently being evaluated by Technical Advisory Team. As per the Technical and Financial Evaluation and Qualification Criteria 1.2 stated in *Annexure B* of the Request for Proposal (RFP) following was required:

*"Company must have been maintaining / managing a workforce, for the last 5 years, as part of waste management operations."*

3. Upon evaluation of the Bid submitted by the Bidder, it was discovered that the Bidder had provided a list of workforces. However, as per the requirement of the RFP, no contracts were presented to justify the number of workforce and duration of management of workforce by the Bidder.

4. Additionally, as per the Technical and Financial Evaluation and Qualification Criteria 1.3 stated in *Annexure B* of the RFP following was required:

*"Should own or have managed Compactors, Arm Roll Trucks, Loaders, Excavators, Mini-tippers and Flatbed trucks for at least 5 years, as part of municipal solid waste management operations."*

5. Upon evaluation of Bid submitted by the Bidder, it was discovered that with the exception of 6 vehicles, all vehicles provided had a registration date of fewer than 5 years, which does not comply with the requirement of minimum duration of owning and managing relevant waste management operations vehicles, as set out in the RFP. Therefore, we require you to clarify your position on the aforementioned observations within three days positively.

6. Additionally, in Annex 2 of the Bid, it has been observed that the Bidder has submitted agreements wherein the party to the agreement was Country Garden Manguo Environmental Technology Group (former name being Changyi Manguo Environmental Sanitation Engineering Co. Ltd.). Could you please clarify your association with Changyi Manguo Environmental Sanitation Engineering Co. Ltd.?

7. Your early and timely response will be appreciated.



**(TARIQ ALI NIZAMANI)**  
Executive Director (F&P)

Copy forwarded for information to:

- 1) Secretary, Sindh Solid Waste Management Board, Karachi.
- 2) Transparency International Pakistan. Plot 72F/2, Floor-1, 9<sup>th</sup> Street, Jami Commercial, DHA, Phase-7, Karachi.
- 3) PS to Managing Director, SSWMB, Karachi.
- 4) M/s EY Ford Rhodes in consortium of M/s Akhund Forbes and Project Procurement International Technical Advisory Team (EY Ford Rhodes, Leading firm), Karachi.
- 5) Master File.

**Gansu Construction Investment Heavy Industry Technology Co., Ltd.,**  
No. 766, Shiyanghe Street, Lanzhou New Area,  
Lanzhou City, Gansu, China

**SUBJECT: CLARIFICATION ON TECHNICAL PROPOSAL SUBMITTED BY GANSU CONSTRUCTION INVESTMENT HEAVY INDUSTRY TECHNOLOGY CO., LTD., IN RELATION TO ESTABLISHMENT OF PRIMARY AND SECONDARY SOLID WASTE COLLECTION SYSTEM FOR SUKKUR (SUKKUR MUNICIPAL CORPORATION JURISDICTION), INCLUDING ROHRI (MUNICIPAL COMMITTEE JURISDICTION) SINDH, PAKISTAN.**

Dear Sir,

I am directed to refer to the subject cited above and to state that Sindh Solid Waste Management Board (**Employer**) invited the bids for the “Establishment of Primary and Secondary Solid Waste Collection System for Sukkur (Sukkur Municipal Corporation Jurisdiction), including Rohri (Municipal Committee Jurisdiction) Sindh, Pakistan”.

2. The Bid submitted by Gansu Construction Investment Heavy Industry Technology Co., Ltd., (**Bidder**) is currently being evaluated by Technical Advisory Team. As per the Technical and Financial Evaluation and Qualification Criteria 2.3 stated in *Annexure B* of the Request for Proposal (RFP) following was required

*“Number of similar assignments with Capex in excess of USD 05 million in last 10 years”*,

3. Upon evaluation of the Bid, we were unable to verify Capex amount in the contract letters provided. Therefore, we require you, Gansu Construction Investment Heavy Industry Technology Co., Ltd., to clarify his position on the aforementioned observation within three days positively.

4. Your early and timely response will be appreciated.

  
(TARIQ ALI NIZAMANI)  
Executive Director (F&P)

Copy forwarded for information to:

- 1) Secretary, Sindh Solid Waste Management Board, Karachi.
- ✓ 2) Transparency International Pakistan. Plot 72F/2, Floor-1, 9<sup>th</sup> Street, Jami Commercial, DHA, Phase-7, Karachi.
- 3) PS to Managing Director, SSWMB, Karachi.
- 4) M/s EY Ford Rhodes in consortium of M/s Akhund Forbes and Project Procurement International Technical Advisory Team (EY Ford Rhodes, Leading firm), Karachi.
- 5) Master File.