



# Sui Southern Gas Company Limited

**Justice Zia Perwez**  
Former Judge of Supreme Court of Pakistan  
Trustee – Transparency International Pakistan  
4-C, Mezzanine Floor  
Khayaban-e-Ittehad, Phase VII  
DHA, Karachi

No. Proc/TPI/9425  
21<sup>st</sup> February 2019

**Re: Violation of Public Procurement Rules, Grievance against Tender Enquiry #  
SSGC/SC/9425 Gas Bill Printing**

Dear Sir,

This is with reference to your letter No. TL19/2501/1A dated: 25<sup>th</sup> January 2019 on the cited subject.

In this regard it is to apprise that one of the aggrieved bidder M/s DWP Technologies (Pvt.) Ltd in the above referred Tender Enquiry approached the PGC in connection with their grievance pertaining to technical evaluation of cited requirement, after uploading of announcement (The announcement was uploaded on 21<sup>st</sup> January 2019).

In accordance with PPRA Rule 48 Clause (1), the aggrieved bidder was heard by PGC held on 28<sup>th</sup> January 2019. The PGC after hearing decided for cancellation of Tender Enquiry # SSGC/SC/9425 and retendering of the said requirement on fast track basis. Pursuant to the PGC directives, the Tender Enquiry # SSGC/SC/9425 (Gas Bill Printing) has been cancelled and fresh tender with revised tender terms will be floated shortly.

The announcement format has also been amended as per MD PPRA's letter F.1 (3)/AD-II/PPRA/12 dated: 6<sup>th</sup> August 2012 which has only been received by us undercover of your above referred letter.

As per PPRA Rules 2004 clause 48 (i), the details of the committee constituted has been forwarded to PPRA.

SSGC as a responsible corporate entity has always maintained highest standards of transparency in its procurement process and its decisions in this regard have been up-held by the Hon'able High Court of Sindh and Supreme Court of Pakistan.

SSGC acknowledges Transparency International Pakistan's efforts for promoting / prevailing transparency across the board in Public Sector procurement activities, which has helped and assisted the public sector entities in maintaining highest transparency in the larger National interest.

Kind regards

For and on behalf of SSGC

  
**Muhammad Ali Khan**  
AGM (Procurement)

CC:

- Secretary to Prime Minister – Islamabad
- Chairman NAB – Islamabad
- DG NAB – ~~Islamabad~~ Karachi
- Chairman PM's Inspection Commission – Islamabad
- Registrar, Supreme Court of Pakistan – Islamabad
- Managing Director PPRA – Islamabad



# TRANSPARENCY INTERNATIONAL-PAKISTAN

4-C, Mezzanine Floor, Khayaban-e-Ittehad, Phase VII,  
Defence Housing Authority, Karachi.  
Tel: (92-21) 35390408, 35311897-8,  
Fax: (92-21) 35390410  
E-mail: ti.pakistan@gmail.com  
Website: www.transparency.org.pk

25<sup>th</sup> January, 2019

TL19/2501/1A

Managing Director,  
Sui Southern Gas Company Ltd,  
SSGC House, Sir Shah Suleman Road,  
Karachi.



**Sub:** Violation of Public Procurement Rules, Grievance against Tender Enquiry No. SSGC/SC/9425 Gas Bills Printing.

Dear Sir,

Transparency International Pakistan has received a complaint from M/s DWP Technologies (Pvt.) Ltd against SSGC regarding Tender Enquiry No. SSGC/SC/9425 Gas Bills Printing.

The complainant has made several allegations including incorrect evaluation. They have alleged that they were given less marks for the following;

1. Number of clients in last three years (with similar scope of work).
2. Past working experience of printing in government / public / private sector organization.
3. Post service support client satisfactory certificates.

They have also alleged that the evaluation report was not provided as per PPRA Rules.

Rule No. 35 of PPRA 2004 is stated below;

**35. Announcement of evaluation reports.-** *Procuring agencies shall announce the results of bid evaluation in the form of a report giving justification for acceptance or rejection of bids at least ten days prior to the award of procurement contract.*

According to PPRA notification No. F. 1(3) AD-II/PPRA/ 12 dated 06.08.2012 (Copy Enclosed). Procuring agencies shall announce the results of bid evaluation in the form of a report giving justification for acceptance or rejection of bids at least ten days prior to the award of procurement contract. Specimen of Bid Evaluation Report is enclosed.

TI- Pakistan has checked the evaluation report on SSGC website and found that it is not according to PPRA guidelines.

PPRA notification No. D.O.No.4-2/M&I/2014 dated 29.10.2014 on Redressal of grievances by the procuring agency (Copy Enclosed). As per clause 4 of the notification, the procuring agency has to complete the Grievance Redressal Committee form and submit to PPRA. Clause 4 states;

4. *In view of the above, kindly ensure compliance of Rule 48(1) of the Public Procurement Rules, 2004 and provide the details of the Committee constituted to this Authority on the enclosed proforma for uploading the same on its website.*





According to PPRA notification No. F. 3(5) DD-II/PPRA/ 2009 dated 10.02.2010 (Copy Enclosed), the Principal Accounting officer as a next logical step should conduct an administrative review on the findings of complaint and take action in accordance with conduct rules in the event of unfair and non-transparent procurement process. The decision of administrative shall be communicated to PPRA, the aggrieved bidder and the procuring entity prior to the award of contract without retarding the procurement process.

The Managing Director is requested to investigate the complaint, and if found genuine direct the concerned department to re-invite the tender as per Public Procurement Rules 2004 and take necessary action under relevant section of NAO 1999 against all those officers involved in corrupt practices.

Transparency International Pakistan is striving for across the board application of Rule of Law, which is the only way to stop corruption.

With Regards,

Justice Zia Perwez  
Former Judge of Supreme Court of Pakistan and High Court of Sindh  
Trustee- TI-Pakistan

Copies forwarded for the information with request to take action under their mandate to:

1. Secretary to Prime Minister, Islamabad.
2. Chairman, NAB, Islamabad.
3. Director General, NAB, Karachi.
4. Chairman, Prime Minister's Inspection Commission, Islamabad.
5. Registrar, Supreme Court of Pakistan, Islamabad.
6. Managing Director, PPRA, Islamabad.